

December 27, 2023

Dear Muhammadong,

**Subject: Review Results for Article "Dynamics of Implementing Islamic Law Through the Islamic Sharia Enforcement Committee in South Sulawesi"**

After a thorough review of your article titled "The Dynamics of Enforcement of Islamic Law in South Sulawesi," we appreciate the effort and dedication you have put into this research. Your article provides insightful observations into the enforcement of Islamic law in South Sulawesi and presents an important contribution to the ongoing discourse on religious law in Indonesia. However, we believe that several aspects of the article need to be addressed and revised to strengthen the research's validity and rigor. We are pleased to inform you that your article is accepted with major revisions. Below, we summarize the strengths of your work and outline the areas that require further revision:

### **Strengths**

1. **Contextual Relevance:** The focus on South Sulawesi, a region with a strong Islamic presence, makes the research particularly relevant. This contextualization enriches the understanding of Islamic law enforcement in local society.
2. **Field Research Approach:** Your use of field research and qualitative methods allows for an in-depth exploration of the dynamics within the community, capturing the real-world implications of Islamic law enforcement.
3. **Socio-Cultural Analysis:** The article's attention to socio-cultural factors affecting the enforcement of Islamic law adds depth to the discussion, presenting a balanced view of societal reactions—both supportive and critical.
4. **Historical and Political Insights:** The historical background and political context provided in the paper help readers understand the evolution of Islamic law in South Sulawesi. This strengthens the discussion of contemporary challenges in enforcing religious law.
5. **Theoretical Framework:** The inclusion of *maqashid al-khamsah* offers a solid theoretical foundation for understanding the purpose of Islamic law, adding scholarly depth to your analysis.

### **Areas for Major Revision**

1. **Lack of Quantitative Data:** While your qualitative approach provides valuable insights, the absence of quantitative data limits the article's generalizability. Including statistical data on the community's acceptance or resistance toward Islamic law enforcement would offer a more comprehensive view.
2. **Potential Bias in Interpretation:** The article appears to lean towards support for the enforcement of Islamic law, with limited attention to dissenting opinions, particularly

from minority or secular communities. A more balanced discussion is necessary to present the full spectrum of viewpoints.

3. **Insufficient Legal Exploration:** Although opposition to Islamic law enforcement is briefly mentioned, the article would benefit from a more detailed analysis of the legal and constitutional challenges that the implementation of Islamic law faces within Indonesia's pluralistic legal system.
4. **Overemphasis on Religious Motivation:** The article primarily focuses on religious motivations for enforcing Islamic law. However, it would be helpful to explore other driving factors, such as socio-political and economic influences, to offer a more rounded perspective.
5. **Lack of Concrete Policy Recommendations:** While you mention the need for government and societal cooperation, the article does not provide specific policy recommendations. Offering more actionable suggestions would enhance the practical relevance of the research.

We believe your research has significant potential but requires substantial revisions to address the concerns outlined above. We encourage you to incorporate quantitative data, present a more balanced interpretation of the findings, and provide a deeper exploration of the legal and policy implications of Islamic law enforcement in South Sulawesi.

We look forward to receiving your revised manuscript for further review. Please feel free to reach out if you have any questions or require clarification on any of the feedback provided.

Sincerely,  
Professor Shaaban Khalil  
Chief Editor  
Zewail City of Science and Technology, Egypt

February 4, 2024

Dear Muhammadong,

**Subject: Acceptance of Revised Article "Dynamics of Implementing Islamic Law Through the Islamic Sharia Enforcement Committee in South Sulawesi"**

We are pleased to inform you that your revised article entitled "*Dynamics of Implementing Islamic Law Through the Islamic Sharia Enforcement Committee in South Sulawesi*" has been accepted for publication in **Letters in High Energy Physics Journal**.

Your article will be included in **Volume 2024** of the journal. We will notify you once the publication process is complete and provide the necessary details regarding the issue and page numbers.

Thank you for your diligent efforts in revising the manuscript and for your valuable contribution to the journal. We look forward to sharing your research with the wider academic community.

If you have any further questions, please feel free to reach out to us.

<https://lettersinhighenergyphysics.com/index.php/LHEP/article/view/581>

Sincerely,  
Professor Shaaban Khalil  
Chief Editor  
Zewail City of Science and Technology, Egypt

August 16, 2023

Dear Muhammadong,

**Subject: Submission Confirmation – "Dynamics of Implementing Islamic Law Through the Islamic Sharia Enforcement Committee in South Sulawesi"**

We are pleased to inform you that your article entitled "*Dynamics of Implementing Islamic Law Through the Islamic Sharia Enforcement Committee in South Sulawesi*" has been successfully submitted to **Letters in High Energy Physics Journal**.

Your submission has been assigned the manuscript ID: **LHEPJ00167**. Please use this ID in all future correspondence regarding your article.

Our editorial team will begin the review process and notify you of the results. In the meantime, you can track the status of your submission via our online system at <http://journals.andromedapublisher.com/index.php/LHEP/login>.

Should you have any questions or need further assistance, feel free to contact our editorial office at [lhep@andromedapublisher.com](mailto:lhep@andromedapublisher.com).

Thank you for choosing *Letters in High Energy Physics* as the venue for your research. We look forward to progressing with your submission.

Sincerely,  
Professor Shaaban Khalil  
Chief Editor  
Zewail City of Science and Technology, Egypt

