

Gmail

mdpi

[Education Sciences] Manuscript ID: education-1036585 - Minor Revisions

Education Sciences Editorial Office <education@mdpi.com>
kepada Siti, saya, Susriyati, Sri, Education

Sel, 8 Des 2020, 08:51

Inggris > Indonesia Terjemahkan pesan Nonaktifkan untuk: Inggris

Dear Professor Zubaidah,

Thank you for submitting your manuscript.

Manuscript ID: education-1036585
Type of manuscript: Article
Title: ReCODE to Re-code: An Instructional Model to Accelerate Students' Critical Thinking Skills
Authors: Sitti Saenab, Siti Zubaidah *, Susriyati Mahanal, Sri Rahayu Lestari
Received: 28 November 2020
E-mails: sitti.saenab@unm.ac.id, siti.zubaidah.fmipa@um.ac.id, susriyati.mahanal.fmipa@um.ac.id, srirahayulestari@um.ac.id
Submitted to section: Higher Education, https://www.mdpi.com/journal/education/sections/Higher_Education

It has been reviewed by experts in the field and we request that you make minor revisions before it is processed further. Please find your manuscript and the review reports at the following link:
<https://susy.mdpi.com/user/manuscripts/resubmit/0e55597c1d41183e9f5acd8434ee0b55>

Your co-authors can also view this link if they have an account in our submission system using the e-mail address in this message.

Gmail mdpi Aktif UNM

28 dari 32

[Education Sciences] Manuscript ID: education-1036585 - Assistant Editor Assigned Eksternal Kotak Masuk x

Betsy Qu <betsy.qu@mdpi.com>
kepada Siti, Betsy, saya, Susriyati, Sri, Education

Inggris > Indonesia Terjemahkan pesan Nonaktifkan untuk: Inggris x

Dear Prof. Dr. Zubaidah,

Your manuscript has been assigned to Betsy Qu for further processing who will act as a point of contact for any questions related to your paper.

Journal: Education Sciences
Manuscript ID: education-1036585
Title: ReCODE to Re-code An Instructional Model to Accelerate Students' Critical Thinking Skills
Authors: Siti Saenab, Siti Zubaidah*, Susriyati Mahanal, Sri Rahayu Lestari

Received: 28 November 2020
E-mails: siti.saenab@um.ac.id, siti.zubaidah.fmipa@um.ac.id, susriyati.mahanal.fmipa@um.ac.id, srirahayulestari@um.ac.id

You can find it here:
https://susy.mdpi.com/user/manuscripts/review_info/0e55597c1d41163e9f5acd8434ee0b55

Best regards,
Betsy Qu
Assistant editor
E-mail: betsy.qu@mdpi.com

Gmail

mdpi

Fwd: [Education Sciences] Manuscript ID: education-1036585 - The fourth report

Siti Zubaidah <siti.zubaidah.fmipa@um.ac.id>
kepada saya, cibici, DNA

Inggris > Indonesia Terjemahkan pesan

Sent from my iPhone

Begin forwarded message

From: "Ms. Betsy Qu/MDPI" <betsy.qu@mdpi.com>
Date: 8 December 2020 8:00:51 AM GMT+7
To: siti.zubaidah.fmipa@um.ac.id
Cc: Education Sciences Editorial Office <education@mdpi.com>
Subject: Re: [Education Sciences] Manuscript ID: education-1036585 - The fourth report

Dear Professor Zubaidah,

The fourth review report will be provided this week. You may prepare the revision according to the current three reports firstly. We will keep you well informed.

Any questions, please feel free to let me know.

Kind regards,
Betsy Qu
Assistant Editor

Gmail

mdpi

[Education Sciences] Manuscript ID: education-1036585 - Minor Revisions

Education Sciences Editorial Office <education@mdpi.com>
kepada Siti, saya, Susriyati, Sri, Education

Sel, 8 Des 2020, 08:51

Inggris > Indonesia Terjemahkan pesan Nonaktifkan untuk: Inggris

Dear Professor Zubaidah,

Thank you for submitting your manuscript.

Manuscript ID: education-1036585
Type of manuscript: Article
Title: ReCODE to Re-code: An Instructional Model to Accelerate Students' Critical Thinking Skills
Authors: Sitti Saenab, Siti Zubaidah *, Susriyati Mahanal, Sri Rahayu Lestari
Received: 28 November 2020
E-mails: sitti.saenab@unm.ac.id, siti.zubaidah.fmipa@um.ac.id, susriyati.mahanal.fmipa@um.ac.id, srirahayulestari@um.ac.id
Submitted to section: Higher Education, https://www.mdpi.com/journal/education/sections/Higher_Education

It has been reviewed by experts in the field and we request that you make minor revisions before it is processed further. Please find your manuscript and the review reports at the following link:
<https://susy.mdpi.com/user/manuscripts/resubmit/0e55597c1d41183e9f5acd8434ee0b55>

Your co-authors can also view this link if they have an account in our submission system using the e-mail address in this message.

Gmail mdpj Aktif UNM

24 dari 32

Siti Zubaidah <siti.zubaidah.fmipa@um.ac.id>
kepada saya, cibici, DNA

Inggris > Indonesia [Terjemahkan pesan](#)

Sent from my iPhone

Begin forwarded message:

From: "Ms. Betsy Qu MDPI" <betsy.qu@mdpi.com>
Date: 8 December 2020 8.00.51. AM GMT+7
To: siti.zubaidah.fmipa@um.ac.id
Cc: Education Sciences Editorial Office <education@mdpi.com>
Subject: Re: [Education Sciences] Manuscript ID: education-1036586 - The fourth report

Dear Professor Zubaidah,

The fourth review report will be provided this week. You may prepare the revision according to the current three reports firstly. We will keep you well informed.

Any questions, please feel free to let me know.

Kind regards,
Betsy Qu
Assistant Editor

Disclaimer: The information and files contained in this message are

Gmail

mdpi

Aktif

UNM

Tulis

Kotak Masuk 1.993

Berbintang

Ditunda

Terkirim

Draf 24

Selengkapnya

Label +

Siti Zubaidah <siti.zubaidah.fmipa@um.ac.id>
kepada cibici, saya, DNA, fitribio

Inggris > Indonesia > Terjemahkan pesan

Sent from my iPhone

Begin forwarded message:

From: "Ms. Betsy Qu/MDPI" <betsy.qu@mdpi.com>
Date: 9 December 2020 7:35:50 AM GMT+7
To: siti.zubaidah.fmipa@um.ac.id
Cc: Education Sciences Editorial Office <education@mdpi.com>
Subject: Re: [Education Sciences] Manuscript ID: education-1036585 - The fourth report

Dear Professor Zubaidah,

Thank you for submitting your manuscript to Education Sciences.

The fourth review report has been provided and you can find it from the following link:

<https://susy.mdpi.com/user/manuscript/resubmit/0e55687c1d41183a9ff5acd6434ee0b55>

Please revise the manuscript according to the reviewers' comments and upload the revised file.

We are looking forward to hearing from you.



1 Article

2 **ReCODE to Re-code: An Instructional Model to** 3 **Accelerate Students' Critical Thinking Skills**

4 Received: 28 November 2020; Accepted: date; Published: date

5 **Abstract:** The instructional models that have been implemented in the classroom could not support
6 the development of students' critical thinking skills. These instructional models can be well
7 implemented if those models can facilitated students with meaningful learning experiences such as
8 reading, connecting prior knowledge to new information being learned in the classroom as well as
9 doing investigation-based activities, discussion activities, and evaluation activities. Author
10 conducted the research to develop ReCODE (Reading, Connecting, Observing, Discussing,
11 Evaluating) instructional model and tools that are valid, practical, and effective. The procedures for
12 developing the model included the preliminary research phase, prototyping phase, and assessment
13 phase. Data on the validity of the model were collected using expert validation instruments, while
14 the practicality of the model was measured using the instruments for the model's component
15 practicality and the model's implementation. The effectiveness of the model was examined using
16 the critical thinking test and questionnaires. The model was implemented to first-year students
17 from the Department of Biology Education, Universitas Negeri Makassar, in the even semester of
18 2018/2019. The results showed that ReCODE was: (1) valid, in terms of the theory underlying the
19 development of the model, the components of the model, and the instructional tools accompanying
20 the model, (2) practical because it had feasible components and the learning process could be
21 carried out successfully, (3) effective in improving student critical thinking skills; the model also
22 received positive responses from the lecturer and the students. Thus, the findings of this study
23 suggest that the ReCODE instructional model can be applied in the classroom to facilitate critical
24 thinking.

25 **Keywords:** ReCODE; Critical Thinking Skills; Instructional Model

26

1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19

1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19

Reviewer 1

No	Suggestion and recommendation	Revision/Rebuttal
1	Exclude from the Introduction lines 39-46 and put them in Conclusion	The Introduction lines 39-46 has already been put to the conclusion
2	Delete 1st sentence after the title 3	The first sentence after the title 3 has been deleted
3	Results, it is unnecessary- overall - all results are not stated and data that conclusions are referred to are not all presented - I recommend to present key results in Preliminary Research (survey results, interview quotes, critical thinking scores, statistical analysis on differences between 1st, 2nd and 3rd year...)	Conclusion has been corrected

Reviewer 2

No	Suggestion and Recommendation	Revision/Rebuttal
1	Abstract	The modification of abstract shown on line 5
2	<p>Data analysis</p> <p>2.1. A severe drawback of the text is the lack of populations descriptions. Authors do not describe the respondents (students, teachers) and experts. Authors do not provide the information on the number of respondents (students, teachers) and experts, how many of them participated in the experiment. Authors fail to provide information on their demographic and socioeconomic characteristics.</p> <p>2.2. The authors use statistical techniques designed for metric scale. Statistical software however smart is not able to distinguish whether the data is measured on a strong metric scale (ratio or interval) or is coming from the weaker, nonmetric measurement scale</p>	<p>Expert validators and respondents are described on lines 150</p> <p>Critical thinking skill data in preliminary research was analyzed using parametric statistic, while the critical thinking skill data in preliminary research were analyzed using descriptive statistic.</p>

Reviewer 4

No	Suggestion and recommendation	Revision/Rebuttal
1	<p>In the first place, it is very important to provide more information within the theoretical-conceptual framework in which the importance of the digital competence of teachers is specified in order to develop innovative methodologies related to socioconstructivist teaching and specifically in methodologies focused on the development of critical thinking. It is especially recommended to cite current articles:</p> <p>Pozo-Sánchez, S., López-Belmonte, J., Fernández, M. F., & López, J. A. (2020). Análisis correlacional de los factores incidentes en el nivel de competencia digital del profesorado. <i>Revista Electrónica Interuniversitaria de Formación del Profesorado</i>, 23(1), 143-151. https://doi.org/10.6018/reifop.396741</p> <p>Pozo-Sánchez, S., López-Belmonte, J., Rodríguez-García, A. M., & López-Núñez, J. A. (2020). Teachers' digital competence in using and analytically managing information in flipped learning. <i>Culture and Education</i>, 32(2), 1-35.</p>	<p>Line 352-355, already added a reference</p> <p>"Besides, the provision of an online platform can familiarize lecturers with practicing digital skills according to the technological, pedagogical and content knowledge (TPACK) framework. This is in line with Ref. [65] stated that to develop pedagogical skills and content knowledge, the teachers/lecturer are also required to be able to integrate technology in learning"</p>

Reviewer 3

No	Suggestion and recommendation	Revision/Rebuttal
1	The instrument should be included, not only the results	The instrument has been added in the appendix
2	The conclusion needs to be completed, as it does not work as a conclusion.	Conclusion has been corrected
3	In some cases, authors are mentioned, instead of following the appropriate reference style	how to cite has been improved -line 45, 107,136, 138, 182, 350

Gmail mdpi Aktif UNM

[Education Sciences] Manuscript ID: education-1036585 - Revised Version Received

Education Sciences Editorial Office <education@mdpi.com>
kepada Siti, saya, Susriyati, Sri, Education

Ser, 14 Des 2020, 09.08

Inggri Indonesia Terjemahkan pesan Nonaktifkan untuk: Inggris

Dear Professor Zubaidah,

Thank you very much for providing the revised version of your paper:

Manuscript ID: education-1036585
Type of manuscript: Article
Title: ReCODE to Re-code: An Instructional Model to Accelerate Students' Critical Thinking Skills
Authors: Sitti Saenab, Siti Zubaidah *, Susriyati Mahanal, Sri Rahayu Lestari
Received: 28 November 2020
E-mails: sitti.saenab@unm.ac.id, siti.zubaidah.fmipa@um.ac.id, susriyati.mahanal.fmipa@um.ac.id, srirahayulestari@um.ac.id
Submitted to section: Higher Education,
https://www.mdpi.com/journal/education/sections/Higher_Education
https://susy.mdpi.com/user/manuscripts/review_info/0e55597c1d41163e9f5acd8434ee0b55

We will continue processing your paper and will keep you informed about the submission status.

Kind regards,

Betsy Qu
Assistant editor

Gmail

mdpi

[Education Sciences] Manuscript ID: education-1036585 - Accepted for Publication

Education Sciences Editorial Office <education@mdpi.com>
kepada Siti, saya, Susriyati, Sri, Education

Min, 20 Des 2020, 14.31

Ingggris > Indonesia Terjemahkan pesan Nonaktifkan untuk: Ingggris

Dear Professor Zubaidah,

We are pleased to inform you that the following paper has been officially accepted for publication.

Manuscript ID: education-1036585
Type of manuscript: Article
Title: ReCODE to Re-code: An Instructional Model to Accelerate Students' Critical Thinking Skills
Authors: Siti Saenab, Siti Zubaidah*, Susriyati Mahanal, Sri Rahayu Lestari
Received: 28 November 2020
E-mails: siti.saenab@unm.ac.id, siti.zubaidah.fmipa@um.ac.id, susriyati.mahanal.fmipa@um.ac.id, sriahayulestari@um.ac.id
Submitted to section: Higher Education,
https://www.mdpi.com/journal/education/sections/Higher_Education
https://susy.mdpi.com/user/manuscripts/review_info/0e55597c1d41163e9f5acd6434ee0b55

We will now make the final preparations for publication, then return the manuscript to you for your approval.

If, however, extensive English edits are required to your manuscript, we will need to return the paper requesting improvements throughout.