

Bilingual Program in Astronomy Class at Islamic University

Nur Zahrah Azizah

zahrah.azizah03@gmail.com

Universitas Negeri Makassar

Haryanto Atmowardoyo

haryanto@unm.ac.id

Universitas Negeri Makassar

Andi Anto Patak

andiantopatak@gmail.com

Universitas Negeri Makassar

Abstract

The research is based on the challenges associated with the implementation of the bilingual program in teaching astronomy class in particular. It focuses on the use of bilingual program in the teaching-learning activities and the responses of students to teaching-learning activities. This study employed a descriptive qualitative analysis approach. The researchers employ the descriptive approach to interpret the data which in the form of phrases. Furthermore, as the data are specified, assessed, interpreted, and extracted from it, the researchers use the qualitative technique. Events, informants, and records are the sources of the research data. The researchers employed observations and interviews to acquire the data as tools for data retrieval. The researchers use notes for the observation phase to see the application of the bilingual program. The interview was used to find the lecturer's bilingual class strategy and the answers of the students to the instructional activities. A lecturer and second-semester students from the Department of Astronomy were the subjects of this study. As the result of this research, the lecturer had applied the bilingual program in teaching astronomy students. Although the lecturer employ two languages in the materials, they are mindful about the demands and curricula of the students when choosing the teaching material. The researchers have revealed that bilingual students are able to apply this strategy in two languages and have a positive response so that it can be used by other lecturers or universities.

Keywords: *Bilingual Program, Implementation, Student's Respons, Islamic University*

INTRODUCTION

Bilingual training uses two dialects as a vehicle of guidance for instructing in tertiary levels, and it becomes famous nowadays. Numerous nations utilized bilingual program in their study hall movement joined with the subject of exercise, for example, science, financial matters, or even astronomy. Since the 2006/2007 school year, Indonesia has actualized a bilingual instructing model on MIPA learning. The point of this execution is to quicken the improvement of the nature of youngsters' schooling from different local gatherings so that all the while, it can accomplish the arrangement of its public principles in dominating science and language.

In carrying out the teaching and learning process, bilingual lecturer must have the ability to use two languages, namely knowledge of technical terms (technical vocabulary) in certain

subjects and knowledge of English. According to Anderson, Theodore, and Mildred Boyer (1970), "Bilingual teaching is defined as teaching two or more languages used in the classroom as the medium of interaction, giving instruction and giving/receiving feedback in any subjects taught than the mother tongue language (L1)" (p.76). It is intended to prepare students to become bilingual, called 'two-way bilingual instruction.'

Lecturer may have no problem while explaining the technical terms because the lecturer already has a background in their knowledge taught, what needs to be developed is knowledge about grammar and the skill of using English for the public (non-pedagogy) and to teach the teaching material (pedagogy). Here, bilingual lecturer holds verbal interactions with students, both one-way and two-way.

Various language functions need to be mastered in teaching material (content knowledge), for example, explaining concepts, reporting certain events, giving definitions, giving instructions, explaining processes, explaining classifications, giving examples, explaining tables, images, illustrations, or graphics, comparing two problems, giving conclusions and others (Gillet, 2007). If lecturer masters this language function, they can build a good environment for students. But the problem is some lecturers have difficulties implementing this language function, especially giving instruction for the students.

In higher education, teaching ESP/EAP must consider the learners' need. Lecturer of ESP must facilitate the teaching learning process that can make students compete internationally, for instance the students can be involved in international events. Responding the condition, the university should develop the curriculum that can fulfill the needs. To fulfill the learners' need, therefore, the astronomy science department formulates the learning objective of English subject that requires students to be able to communicate ideas and information both verbal and non-verbal and to access English textbooks and articles in international journal related to their major.

In fact, the students of astronomy science department still have low ability to communicate in English. The students learned the target language used translation strategy. When they were in discussion class, they thought in native language. They arranged their words in Indonesia then translated into English.

Moreover, data from observation and the interviews showed that the lecturer used native and target language as a language instruction in the teaching process. The lecturer opened the class using target language and sometimes using native language to explained new vocabularies. The lecturer used native language to explain about the material, and to give instruction. Sometimes lecturer gave instruction in English then translated into the native language. Using native and target language as a medium of instruction means bilingual instruction. Here, the lecturer used code-switching and code-mixing strategies. In relation to the phenomenon, Yih-Lin et al. (2014) suggest that strategic use of code-mixing of bilinguals' L1 and L2 in instruction may enhance students' bilingual development and maximize their learning efficacy.

Thus, this research aims to describe the implementation of the bilingual program and the students' response in Astronomy Class at UIN Alauddin Makassar.

METHOD

This study used a descriptive method of qualitative research. The participants were the students of Astronomy Class of Islamic University academic year 2019/2020 and also the lecturer. In collecting the data in this research, the researchers used three kinds of instruments:

interview guideline, observation checklist, and documents. In analyzing the data from the observation and interview, the researchers used some steps which deal with the procedures in analyzing qualitative research data. The through interview was analyzed through interactive model of Milles & Huberman (2018), namely: (1) data condensation, (2) data display, and (3) conclusion drawing and verification.

FINDINGS

1. The Implementation of the Bilingual Program in Astronomic Class

a. Lecturers' Strategy

Teachers' understanding on their role in online learning was depicted by five aspects. Since English as the instructional language is impossible to use completely, the teaching-learning activities are carried out in bilingual education systems. A bilingual Indonesian language programme, which is Astronomy, utilizes the topic content of L1 (Indonesian language) and L2, (Foreign language "English").

Dual Language strategy is the teaching approach accomplished in the bilingual program in the class. This model indicates that the instructor uses fractional English to impart content instead of complete English. The longer the language speaker uses English, the greater the vocabulary the students receive.

"I still use two language, 50-50 with English and Insya Allah, the English will increase so students will get used to the language." Referred Lecturer AK.

Lecturer AK expressed that by utilizing English in teaching-learning activities, the students could grasp the themes that they learn in English talk matter as well as in other talk matters, in this case, Astronomy. It accepts that it isn't sufficient to comprehend English exclusively for its phonetics perspectives in facing globalization.

b. Lecturer's Role

Researcher found some roles that lecturer implied in the classroom. The first role is as apprentice. In the classroom activity, lecturer can be as the facilitator and the motivator, the lecturer acts in a fair and enjoyable way with his students. The lecturer must also provide the contents to be transmitted with a reasonable source and acceptable educational media and not make them the only way for the students to study. The lecturer functions as the apprentice to promote the understudies to develop their innovation and achievements.

"in my point of view, every language lecturer have the same role, as facilitator or even motivator. There are also some rules from government that talks about educator's role, right? It's all depends on me as a lecturer to see the students' need because every students have different understanding when learn English"

The lecturer serves as the facilitator and incentive for instruction. The lecturer acts fairly and pleasantly with his students as the facilitator. The lecturer must also communicate content in a realistic and appropriate instructional format and not make it the only way for learners to learn.

The lecturer is the apprentice for undergraduate studies to produce originality and accomplishments.

The next role is as a material designer. The lecturer needs to make a lesson plan, pick a reasonable material with the syllabus, and adjust the material to be fitting with the level of students' expertise, or give new material when there is no material to be taught.

" and I also prepare some simple exercise out of the handbook that students already have, and actually I have made lesson plan so we know what we learn based on the students need .."

The third is as an evaluator. Lecturer has duty to evaluate the effectiveness of teaching material and result of students' learning.

"I gave evaluation in the end of every meeting to let me know how they understand about the material that I have given. Here, is my role as evaluator for them"

c. The Student's Role

In teaching-learning activities, the students are required to be dynamic in the classroom. They are effectively occupied with making them understand each other, in any event, when their insight into the target language is not adequate. The students arrive at singular comprehension by effectively focusing on the lecturer's explanation, asking question, and presenting material after discussing.

The learners often utilized Indonesian as a question when it came to use the language in their classroom. When the understanding of the content was difficult, they would query the professor by using Indonesian.

"Kalo tanya sama bu guru, masih pakai bahasa Indonesiaja, Kak. Tapi kalo jawab pertanyaan harus pakai bahasa Inggris karena soalnya bahasa Inggris juga."

d. Lecturer's Lesson Plan

The university uses the same curriculum as a traditional university in order to attain its aim in subject matter because it has and employs the same curriculum. The distinction resides in the "X" component that must be met by the PIBA curriculum. The PIBA curriculum is the curriculum of the astronomy class. The instructor is needed in Indonesian and English to plan two curricula. In the lesson plan, the two syllabi are executed.

The form of the lesson plan was arranged by means of English and Indonesian, on the basis of the analysis of the research paper. The curriculum and the curriculum in the standard course includes basic skills, indicators, primary materials and learning activities as well as the worksheets and score system, but a curriculum and the curriculum in the PIBA curriculum are based on a different curriculum. RPS can be seen on the appendix.

e. The Roles of Instructional Material

In teaching-learning activities, the roles of instructional material are essential. Instructional materials are fundamental. The lecturer clarified the material from multiple points of view.

During the teaching-learning activity, the lecturer likewise applied a few exercises showing her inventiveness. They utilized writings, pictures (charts and figures), visual guides (animation, PowerPoint), which dealt with the topic being learned.

"Sometimes I used LCD when teaching, especially when I wanted to show them video that related to the study, and also authentic materials like bulletin, and brochure or other non-authentic material."

Since it is a PIBA curriculum, the material should be arranged in English for some subject matters, in this case, Astronomy. Based on the observation the researcher did, the lecturer utilized English when she gave the students a few materials or notes. To make the students comprehend, the lecturer likewise gave some vocabulary that students did not know. She would write the words on the whiteboard, so every one of the students would see the remarks.

2. The Student's Response toward Bilingual Instruction Model

a. Interaction from Lecturer to Students

There are two forms of interaction, verbal and nonverbal communication, on the basis of Ornstein and Lasley II (2000:39). In this case, the lecturer used the material bilingually to instruct or supply. She was more worried with the mastery of the material notion but did not ignore the use of English. At the time of oral communication, the speaker concentrated on language as the main tool for teaching communication. The lecturers interacted verbally with students through one-way or two-way communication in a bilingual teaching scenario.

"...so when I interacted with them I always try to emphasize the content material without denying the language used that is English. Then to make students more enthusiast with the lesson, I also gave some words game about Astronomy while learning. They love it more in that way." (Interview with Lecturer AK on Friday, July 10th 2020)

The researcher noticed that the lecturer communicated verbally when he was observing the astronomical lesson held on Thursday, 12 March 2020, expressing the concept of the content, defining, offering instruction, presenting examples and concluding. The language used was English when the lecturer made these verbal communications. She stressed in Indonesian in any event. The speaker made two contributions during the teaching-learning process. First there were grammar error feedbacks. When the lecturer learns that the students committed grammar errors they were helping those students, even if the investigator discovered that the lecturer made grammar errors sometimes. The second comment was that the terminology is misunderstood. Both criticisms were provided by the lecturer in textual form to evaluate the learning of students. It also happened orally that the lecturer dialogued with the students to complete their job during the teaching-learning activity.

b. Students Interaction

Interaction between students and students has a greater part in classroom activities as the interaction between students' influences students goals and achievements, improves social skills and promotes the viewpoint of others. In order to succeed in a student-student interaction, the lecturer has two key components to control, namely how students' disagreements are managed and how the learning aims are framed.

" ... I made this so that there will be an interaction among students, that is by separate the/ peer them in groups. When made the group, I would give a case or topic, and then I asked them to answer it by discussing it with their friends. When giving the instruction I used English and try to not use Indonesia. But when it's urgent I would use Indonesia" (Interview with Lecturer AK)

From the citation above, it uncovers the lecturer made collaboration among understudies by making groups. At the point when the students were separated into certain gatherings, the lecturer gave them activities to do. The example of communication that happens in students' collaboration may in any case be shared by lecturer and students. In this research context, the lecturer decided to control the structure and content of interaction among students, depend on her instruction goals, the idea of her classroom events, and the type of student-student interaction that she would have liked to advance.

1) Learning full English

Students are asked about their opinion if their class using full English. Their response is quite the same as one another. They showed positive reactions to the possibility of learning with full English.

" Menurut saya belajar bahasa full english sangat baik dan berdampak positif dikarenakan bahasa inggris merupakan bahasa international yang dapat mempermudah kita dalam bidang hal apapun dan ketika memakai full English akan mengefisienkan dalam belajar bahasa Inggris karena seperti pepatah ala bisa krna biasa. Tetapi ada kendala ketika kita tidak tahu arti dri bahasa Inggris tersebut."

Students from the Astronomy class positively respond to English as the target language if used fully in the study. Their reasons are varied from the effectiveness of learning, the perception that English is necessary, and the benefit for their future work. But they understood that is all need more effort and consistency to get a good result, like what student AZB said that:

" belajar dengan full English sebetulnya sangat membantu dan mempermudah kita dalam penguasaan bahasa Inggris, tetapi semua itu harus dibarengi dengan keseriusan dan sungguh sungguh."

2) Learn with two languages

Students are also asked if their class uses two languages, those are English and Indonesian. They have a good response to this situation. They convince that using two languages to learn Astronomy is more efficient, like what is shown in the passage below.

" Metode dua bahasa lebih efisien karena mahasiswa/i banyak belum lancar berbahasa inggris dan mengartikan bahasa itu sendiri. " (APY interviewed on 09th 2020)

From the quotation, the researcher could say using two languages in learning can help students understand the content language and the language used in the learning process. They thought that although English is necessary from Elementary school until university, there are many students who have less understanding when using English in the class, especially about the vocabulary.

3) Student-student Interaction

Student-student interaction in the class is essential to influence students' educational aspirations and achievement. Based on the observation and the interview, the interaction among students in the Astronomy class still use Bahasa to communicate. Some of them mix Bahasa with their regional language to make them more comfortable and easier to communicate.

These showed from what the student AFK says:

*" Bahasa yang saya gunakan adalah bahasa Indonesia dibarengi aksen makassar/
campur makassar-indonesia*

Student APY has the same way to interact with her friends.

*"Saya berbahasa indonesia bercampur bahasa daerah yang lebih dipahami teman dan
bahasa yang lebih santai kepada teman"*

4) Student-Lecturer interaction

The interaction among students and their lecturer in these teaching-learning activities uses two languages, English and Indonesia. In verbal communication, the students will use English as much as they know the English words when answering the lecturer's questions. They will use Indonesia if they feel hard to say the words in English. It shows from the interview with students DY that say:

" Saya mencoba berbahasa inggris, kalo susah kata katanya saya campurki."

Other responses say that they prefer to use Indonesia when talking with their lecturer because it is easier for them to communicate unless they are asked in written form in the exercise that is given for them.

DISCUSSIONS

In the research findings, the researcher explains various research findings regarding bilingualism in the astronomy department's teaching-learning activities, which have been noticed in several areas at the UIN Alauddin. The scientist discussed it with the other relevant references in order to justify the research finding.

Lecturer must use English as the instructional language in the PIBA curriculum. It is not possible for lecturer to make full use of English in the provision of resources, thus the instructional activities take place in the bilingual programme. In order to study the contents of the subject matter, in this instance astronomy, the multilingual software utilizes L1 (Indonesian language). In this area of study, bilingual transitional education is the teaching methodology conducted in a bilingual programme. The lecturer employed partial English rather than full English to teach the materials. It corresponds to Krashen in 1997, who says that the use of language in part is demonstrated by bilingual transitional schooling. The longer professors use English, the more vocabulary the students receive.

In order for students to establish worldwide standards and global competitiveness, their bilingual training in particular areas, astronomy, is reasonable. Lecturer showed the information in English during the teaching-learning activity. They also offered undergraduate companies and

English notes. What the professors achieved is to achieve shrewd understudies with global serious ability, in line with the vision and purpose of the PIBA education program.

With regard to communication in the classroom, the lecturer understood that improvements were still needed. The students should interpret properly what the instructors mean in delivering the documentation or performing activities. The observation that the students still had diverse interpretations of what lecturer meant in their educational activities can show this scenario. The manner in which the lecturer explained the topic was not fully grasped. Lecturer commonly used the Indonesian language in order to enable students to comprehend it properly. Students still use the Indonesian language while asking questions. The students found it challenging to ask queries in English. However, lecturer always demanded that the students answer the question of the lecturer in English, although they have utilized their mother tongue in contact with the students. The report is related to Johnson's statement (1996: 99) which says it is crucial to remember that it depends on the pedagogical objective of the lesson how the lecturer organize the patterns of communication. It suggests that during this part of the lesson, the lecturer may have decided to take greater control of communication practice to ensure that the students grasped what they felt essential to carry out follow-up writing activities, e.g. vocabulary.

All plans and curricula have been developed in Indonesian and English in terms of the model curriculum. The lessons of the speakers are based on the program. The curriculum program for PIBA was the same as the curricular curriculum; however Indonesian and English languages were used. The researcher observed that the professors have picked material for the topics in the curriculum and have adapted it to the requirements and interests of the students. In line with the statement of Haryana (2007: 41), the 'X' indicator is the key to additionally to operation indicators, namely (1) Adjustments which contain elements of quality that are internationally recognized between SNP and one of the members of the NS or other developed countries that have specific excellence in education; and (2) Adoption which, via reliance on the educational standard of national standards members or other developed countries, enhances several aspects that do not exist in the 8-element of SNP. The lecturer was not the one who delivered the subject during the teaching-learning activities, but the students also had to be involved in the class. The lecturer tried to make the understudied exercises dynamic through the lecturer's requests, answers and an appreciation of the teaching materials. Reinforcement and comments were provided by professors in order to increase and motivate students. The students do most of the work when learning is active, in keeping with Silbeeman's assertion (1996: ix). You use your intellect, research ideas, solve issues and use what you learn. What the lecturer has done above is also a motivator. It corresponds to the job of the lecturer, who is a motivator and facilitator. All lecturers should strive to improve students' best performance. The most effective approaches, tactics, procedures and principles should be applied by a lecturer to ensure that the students achieve maximum capability.

On the grounds of class observations, it was shown that in classroom lecturer explained an English-language concept in Indonesia and explained it in Indonesia. Baker (2011) says certain teacher in schools convey a single language topic and then explain it in another language again, believing that repetition contributes to enhanced understanding and completion of the concept. The lecturer code turns to native language to clarify the significance of the target language education and therefore emphasizes the relevance of the content of a foreign language to make it

understandable (Sert, 2005). Something to clarify should be clearer and usually alternate the lecturer's language from L2 to L1.

Positive reaction to bilingual models of education is provided to astronomy students. The students considered that bilingual models of education have a good effect on the understanding of educational content. Despite this fact several students believed that their vocabulary was still challenging to understand the English language of the lecturer. They thought of mixing and changing the languages in the classroom, helping them communicate. It's in accordance with student AFK, it's truly extremely easy to learn in two languages for beginners or anyone learning English, because there's not much recognized vocabulary, so that it's extremely efficient for someone new to English and helps them master English more quickly.

CONCLUSIONS

The lecturer has several tactics that are aimed at bilingualism, lecturers' roles, students' roles, a lecturer's plan and lecturer's duties. The tasks of the lecturer are not only motivators and facilitators, but also trainees, material designers and evaluators. The lecturer has direct interaction with the teaching students

Learning activities and English knowledge are required in order to conduct their education. The lecturer must be active and the lecturer provides advice and instructions to the students.

The lecturer must prepare two syllabuses in Indonesian and English in the creation of the lesson plan, which conform to curricular and content standards. The curriculum is based on a version of the PIBA curriculum used for UIN Alauddin Makassar. The lecturers arrange it in English when supplying the content. When giving information, notes or tasks to the students, the lecturer utilizes English. Lecturer teaches them a word that they have not taught before. The lecturers take the paper from both a national and an international textbook. The information is in English and is relevant to the curricula and academic demands of the students.

The response of the students to the employment of the astronomical bilingual education model demonstrates that the two languages of the students are used, but mostly the English teaching activity. The instructor explains this using Bahasa if the speaker utilizes English and the students have not yet absorbed the content. The lecturer utilizes English for questions regarding the materials and the students reply in English. Students cannot easily answer queries from the lecturer in English. Some errors still exist in grammar or the meaning of the language is not understood. When the lecturer knows it, she aids and corrects the students.

REFERENCES

- Abduh, A (2018). Lecturers' Perception on Factors influencing the Implementation of Bilingual Instruction in Universities. *Journal of Applied Research in Higher Education*.
- Andersson, T., & Boyer, M. (1970). *Bilingual schooling in the United States*.
- Asnawati, M., Tamsah, H., Sakkir, G., Saleh, F., & Umanailo, M. C. B. The Influence of Teaching Experience and Education Level of Teacher Performance Through Work Loads at Formal Education Unit (SPF) of Senior High School (SMAN).
- Atmowardoyo, H. (2018). Research methods in TEFL studies: Descriptive research, case study, error analysis, and R & D. *Journal of Language Teaching and Research*, 9(1), 197-204.

- Baker, C. (2011). Foundations of Bilingual Education and Bilingualism. *Zhurnal Eksperimental'noi I Teoreticheskoi Fiziki*, 497. <https://doi.org/10.2307/330123>
- Bowen, G. A. (2009). Document analysis as a qualitative research method. *Qualitative research journal*.
- Brutt-Griffler, J. (2002). World English: A study of its development (Vol. 34). *Multilingual Matters*.
- Cai, C., Zhang, C., Wang, Y., Xiong, L., Jin, Y., & Jin, C. (2016). Nursing students' satisfaction with bilingual teaching in nursing courses in China: A meta-analysis. *Nurse Education Today*, 44, p.51–58.
- Christensen, L. B., Johnson, B., Turner, L. A., & Christensen, L. B. (2014). Research methods, design, and analysis.
- Creswell, J. W., & Poth, C. N. (2018). *Qualitative inquiry and research design: Choosing among five approaches*. Sage publications.
- Cummins, J. (1978a). "Metalinguistic development of children in bilingual education programs: Data from Irish and Canadian Ukrainian-English programs". In *The Fourth Lacus Forum 1977*, Edited by: Paradis, M.29–40.Columbia, S C: Hornbeam Press.
- Cummins, J. (1978b). Bilingualism and the development of metalinguistic awareness. *Journal of Cross Cultural Psychology*, 9, 131–149.
- Cummins, J. (2000). Language, power, and pedagogy: Bilingual children in the crossfire (Vol. 23). *Multilingual Matters*.
- De Mejia, A.-M. (2002). Power prestige, and bilingualism: International perspectives on elite bilingual education (vol.35). *Multilingual Matters*.
- Diaz, R. M. (1984). The intellectual power of bilingualism.
- Diaz, R. M. and Padilla, K. The self regulatory speech of bilingual preschoolers. (1985) *Meetings of the Society for Research in Child Development*. Toronto, Canada.
- Dudley-Evans, T., & St John, M. J. (1998). *Developments in English for specific purposes: A multi-disciplinary approach*. Cambridge university press.
- Flood, A. (2010). Understanding phenomenology. *Nurse researcher*, 17(2).
- Flowerdew, J., & Peacock, M. (2001). Issues in EAP: Apreliminary perspective. *Research Perspectives on English for Academic Purposes*, 824.
- Gall, M.D., Gall, J.P., Borg, W.R. (2014). *Applying educational research: how to read, do, and use research to solve problems of practice* (6th ed.). Boston: Pearson.
- Gay, L., Mills, G., & Airisian, P. (2012). Overview of qualitative reserch." *Educational research: Competencies for analysis and applications*.
- Gilbert, M. C., Musu-Gillette, L. E., Woolley, M. E., Karabenick, S. A., Strutchens, M. E., & Martin, W. G. (2014). Students perceptions of the classroom environment: Relations to motivation and achievement in mathematics. *Learning Environments Research*, 17(2), 287-

304.

- Giorgi, A., & Giorgi, B. (2003). *Phenomenology*. Sage Publications, Inc.
- Guba, E.G. and Lincoln, Y.S., (2013). *Competing paradigms in qualitative research*. *Handbook of qualitative research*, p.37.
- Hakuta, K., Ferdman, B. M. and Diaz, R. M. (1986). *Bilingualism and cognitive development: Three perspectives and methodological implications* UCLA: Center for Language Education and Research
- Hamers, J. F., Blanc, M., & Blanc, M. H. (2000). *Bilinguality and bilingualism*. Cambridge University Press.
- Howard, E. R., Sugarman, J., Christian, D., Lindholm-Leary, K. J., & Rogers, D. (2007). *Guiding principles for dual language education*. Washington, DC: Center for Applied Linguistics.
- Hyland, K. (2006). *English for academic purposes: An advanced resource book*. Routledge.
- Hyland, K., & Hamp-Lyons, L (2002). *Issues and directions*. *Journal of English for Academic Purposes*, 1(1), 1-12
- Johns, A. M., & Price-Machado, D. (2001) *English for specific purposes: Tailoring course to students needs- and to the outside world*. *Teaching English as a Second or Foreign Language*, 3, 43-54.
- Johnson, W. (1996). *The Spoken Word and The Great Unsaid*. *ETC: A Review of General Semantics*, 28-40.
- Lee, P. (2014). *Cognitive development in bilingual children: A case for bilingual instruction in early childhood education*. *Bilingual Research Journal*, 20(3-4), 499-522.
- Mann, S. (2016). *The Research Interview: Reflective Practice and Reflexivity in Research Processes*.
- Miller, R. L., Rycek, R. F., & Fritson, K. (2011). *The effects of high impact learning experiences on student engagement*. *Procedia-Social and Behavioral Sciences*, 15, 53-59.
- Milles, M.B., Huberman, & Saldana, J. (2014). *Qualitative Data Analysis: A Sourcebook Methods*.
- Moustakas, C. (1994). *Phenomenological research methods*. Sage publications.
- Nassaji, H. (2015). *Qualitative and descriptive research: Data type versus data analysis*.
- Noor, F. M., & Harun, H. (2015). *Phenomenological Study: Bilingual Teaching Classroom of Malaysian Community Colleges*. *Procedia-Social and Behavioral Sciences*, 204, p.114–118.
- Nurpahmi, S. (2018). *Structured bilingual based instruction model in teaching English for specific purposes*. In *Proceedings of INACELT (International Conference on English Language Teaching)* (Vol. 2, No. 1, pp. 111-118).
- Nurpahmi, S., Rahman, M. A., & Salija, K. (2018). *Bilingual-based Instruction in Teaching English for Academic Purposes at Islamic University*. *Journal of Language Teaching and*

Research, 9(3), 620-628.

- Olson, D. R. (1977). Oral and written language and the cognitive processes of children. *Journal of Communication*, 27: 10–26.
- Hakuta, K., Ferdman, B. M. and Diaz, R. M. 1986. *Bilingualism and cognitive development: Three perspectives and methodological implications* UCLA: Center for Language Education and Research.
- Ornstein, A. C., & Lasley, I. I. (2013). *TJ* (2004). *Strategies for effective teaching*.
- Peal, E. and Lambert, W. (1962). The relation of bilingualism to intelligence. *Psychological Monographs*, 76, 1–23.
- Pennycook, A. (2010). *Language as a local practice*. Routledge
- Piaget, J. (1929). *The child's conception of the world*, London: Routledge and Kegan Paul.
- Rahman, H., Sakkir, G., & Khalik, S. (2020). Audio-Lingual Method to Improve Students's Speaking Skill at Smp Negeri 1 Baranti. *La Ogi: English Language Journal*, 6(1), 15-21.
- Silberman, M. L., & Biech, E. (2015). *Active training: A handbook of techniques, designs, case examples, and tips*. John Wiley & Sons.
- Thompson, G. L., & Harrison, K. (2014). Language use in the foreign language classroom. *Foreign Language Annals*, 47(2), 321-337.
- Tollefson, J. W. (2006). *Critical theory in language policy. An introduction to language policy: Theory and method*, 1, 42-59.
- Tsui, A. (n.d). *BM 1995. Introduction Classroom Interaction*. New York: Penguin English.
- Vygotsky, L. (1986). *Thought and language*, Edited by: Kozulin, A. Cambridge: MIT Press