

PAPER NAME

15468-49311-1-PB.pdf

AUTHOR ANSHARI UNM

WORD COUNTCHARACTER COUNT3949 Words23060 CharactersPAGE COUNTFILE SIZE8 Pages456.3KBSUBMISSION DATEREPORT DATEDec 14, 2022 3:49 PM GMT+8Dec 14, 2022 3:50 PM GMT+8

# • 11% Overall Similarity

The combined total of all matches, including overlapping sources, for each database.

- 10% Internet database
- Crossref database
- 7% Submitted Works database

# Excluded from Similarity Report

• Small Matches (Less then 20 words)

- 5% Publications database
- Crossref Posted Content database
- Manually excluded sources



# Journal of Educational Science and Technology

Volume 7 Number 1 April 2021 page 18-25 p-ISSN: 2460-1497 and e-ISSN: 2477-3840 DOI: https://doi.org/10.26858/est.v7i1.15468



# The Contribution of Academic Supervision and Teacher Working Group on Teachers' Pedagogical Competence

Sirajuddin Saleh<sup>1</sup>, Arismunandar<sup>2</sup> Anshari<sup>2</sup>

<sup>1</sup>Office Administration, Universitas Negeri Makassar, Indonesia Email: sirasaleh1971@gmail.com
<sup>2</sup>Educational Administration, Universitas Negeri Makassar, Indonesia Email: risnandar@yahoo.com
<sup>3</sup>Indonesian Education, Universitas Negeri Makassar, Indonesia Email: anshari@unm.ac.id

(*Received*: 23-10-2020; *Reviewed*: 18-11-2020; *Accepted*: 16-01-2021; *Available online*: 20-01-2021; *Published*: 07-04-2021)



This is an open access article distributed under the Creative Commons Attribution License CC-BY-NC-4.0 ©2021 by author (<u>https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/</u>).

**bstract.** The purpose of this study was to determine: 1) an overview of the implementation of academic supervision, the Teacher Working Group (KKG), and teachers' pedagogic competences; 2) The effect of academic supervision and the Teacher Working Group (KKG) on the pedagogical competence of elementary school teachers in Manggala District, Makassar City. This quantitative study was performed in the form of an associative research. The objects of this study were 309 elementary school teachers at 30 schools in Manggala District, Makassar City. Samples were 50% of the total population (155 people) selected using a proportional random sampling technique. Data were collected from questionnaire, observation, and documentation. The obtained data were then analyzed using descriptive statistics and hypotheses were tested based on inferential statistic test. The results of the study showed that: The effectiveness of academic supervision was regarded moderate, while the Teacher Working Group (KKG) was considered effective. In addition, teachers' pedagogical competence was categorized moderate category. Furthermore, the academic supervision and the Teacher Working Group showed a positive and significant contribution on the pedagogical competence of elementary school teachers in Manggala Kota District Makassar. Thus, it can be concluded that academic supervision activities carried out by school principals and activities carried out in the Teacher Working Group (KKG) forum improved elementary school teachers' pedagogical competence.

Keywords: Academic Supervision; Teacher Working Group; Pedagogic Competence;

### INTRODUCTION

There are four competences of a professional teacher including personality competence, social competence, pedagogical competence, and professional competence (Republik Indonesia, 2005). These competences imply the broad role of teachers as educators whose main task is to provide assistance and motivation (supporter), supervision and guidance, as well as disciplining students to comply with school rules and norms that apply in the family and society (Slameto, 2016), (Sabandi, 2013).

Based on the results of the competence test in 2012, out of 281,016 people who took the exam, there were 249,001 participants obtaining an national average score of 42.25(Jurotun et al., 2015). The 2018 National Education Balance (Neraca Pendidikan Daerah) data released by the Ministry of Education and Culture of the Republic of Indonesia showed that the average scores Teachers' Competence Test for elementary school, junior high school, senior high school, and vocational high school were 52.25, 56.56, 57.15, and 55.45 consecutively in Makassar City. The average pedagogical competence score was 51.69, while the average score of teachers' professional competence was 56.76. These data indicated that the average competence test score was still below the expected standard, namely 70. The teacher's competence test scores were not vet optimal, especially their pedagogic competence and professional competence which should be improved for better professionalism.

Some efforts can be carried out improve teachers' competence, including supervision (Cleary, 2019), (Asrini et al., 2014). Supervision activity helps schools identify their problems and propose feasible solutions (Blandford, 2014), (Gumiarta, 2019). Meanwhile, Jahanian & Ebrahimi (2013) insisted that supervision is a joint effort to study the factors that affect the growth and development of student learning.

Supervision activities that can be carried out by school principals and school supervisors to improve the learning process are academic supervision by providing assistance and guidance to teachers to develop their ability to manage the learning process to achieve learning objectives (Kotirde & Yunos, 2015), (Sanders et al., 2017), (Muslim, 2017). Supervision is an activity carried out by school principals and school supervisors to assist in such a way to enable teachers to learn in order to improve their personal abilities in achieving the predetermined learning objectives (Tepper et al., 2011), (Rafferty & Restubog, 2011), (Rahabav, 2016), (Dangara, 2015).

Sergiovanni, (2013) stated that academic supervision is the assistance for teachers to develop their competence to achieve teaching goals. Academic supervision is not carried out to assess teachers' performance in managing the learning process. Instead, it is done to provide assistance for teachers to develop their competence. Thus, it can be understood that academic supervision carried out by school principals and supervisors is intended to improve the ability of teachers in managing the learning process, both from the aspects of planning, implementation, and assessment of learning outcomes.

On the other side, some studies conclude that assistance and guidance through supervision have not been effective (Yunus et al., 2016), (Faiqoh, 2019). Therefore, another effort needs to be conducted to improve teacher abilities is through the Teacher Working Group (Kelompok Kerja Guru, abbreviated as KKG). The results of a study conducted by Al Rasyid and Lubis indicate that the Teacher Working Group or KKG forum is expected to positively contribute to the improvement of teachers' competence which was not well-improved in previous programs (Al Rasyid, 2015), (Lubis, 2017). This shows that teachers' competences are important matters to concern among those who are responsible for improving teacher competence through academic supervision including supervisors and the school principal.

## METHOD

This study employed an associative model of the quantitative approach. This approach is used to obtain numerical data through instruments and to interpret certain phenomena directly from the obtained data (Sugiyono, 2014). The population of this study included 309 teachers from 30 elementary schools. A proportional random sampling technique was employed to select 155 samples (50%). The data of this study were collected using a questionnaire, observation, and documentation.

The obtained data were analyzed using the percentage descriptive analysis. Meanwhile, to answer the hypothesis, the data were analyzed using inferential statistics (multiple regression analysis). Multiple regression analysis was conducted to determine the direction of the relationship between independent variables and the dependent variable.

In order to determine the relationship between two or more independent variables (academic supervision and KKG) on the variable pedagogical ability of teachers simultaneously, multiple correlation analysis was carried out simultaneously. The coefficient obtained from the analysis showed the magnitude of the relationship between the independent variables simultaneously and on the dependent variables simultaneously and on the dependent variable. To determine the percentage effect of academic supervision and KKG variables on teacher pedagogical ability variable, determination analysis (R<sup>2</sup>) was utilized. This coefficient determines the percentage of the independent variables to explain the dependent variable. To determine the partially significant effect of the regression model of the academic supervision by the school principal and KKG variables on the teacher pedagogical competence variable, a partial regression coefficient test (t-test) was administered.

## **RESULTS AND DISCUSSION**

#### Results

The findings of this study illustrate that the implementation of academic supervision shows the highest percentage in the moderate category, 89.7%. Meanwhile, the results of the descriptive statistical analysis of the academic supervision by principal obtained an average value (mean) of 118.14, considered a moderate category. The following table 1 presents the details.

Interval	Category	Frequency	Percentage
$168 < (x) \le 200$	Very High	0	0
$136 < (x) \le 168$	High	4	2.58
$104 < (x) \le 136$	Moderate	139	89.7
$72 < (x) \le 104$	Low	12	7.74
$40 < (x) \le 72$	Very Low	0	0
Total		155	100

Table 1. Distribution of Academic Supervision by School Principal Questionnaires Results

Source: Field research, 2018

The activities of the Teacher Working Group (KKG) showed the highest percentage in the high category of 90.3%. The results of descriptive statistical analysis of the category of respondents' answers obtained an average value (mean) of 149.96, in the high category:

Interval	Category	Frequency	Percentage
$168 < (x) \le 200$	Very effective	2	1.29
$136 < (x) \le 168$	Effective	_	
$104 < (x) \le 136$	Quite effective	140	90.3
		13	8.39
$72 < (x) \le 104$	Less effective	0	0
$40 < (x) \le 72$	Ineffective	0	0
Tot	al	155	100

Source: Field research, 2018

The highest percentage of teacher pedagogical ability was in the moderate category of 95.5%. The results of a descriptive statistical analysis based on the frequency of choice of the

respondents' answer category obtained an average value (mean) of 121.52 or were in the moderate category. The following table describes in details:

#### **21** | Vol 7 No 1, April 2021

Interval	Category	Frequency	Percentage
$168 < (x) \le 200$	Very high	0	0
$136 < (x) \le 168$	High	0	0
$150 \times (X) = 100$	mgn	5	3.23
$104 < (x) \le 136$	Moderate	140	05.5
$72 < (x) \le 104$	Low	148	95.5
$72 < (x) \le 104$	Low	2	1.29
$40 < (x) \le 72$	Very low	0	0
Tota	al	155	100

Table 3. Distribution of Teacher Pedagogical Competence Questionnaire Results

Source: Field research, 2018

The results of the regression analysis were to determine the direction of the relationship between the academic supervision variable and the KKG variable on the pedagogical competence variable of each teacher and to predict the value of the teacher pedagogical competence ability variable if the value of the academic supervision and KKG variables decreased or increased. The equation was:  $Y = a + b_1X_1 + b_2X_2$  dan Y =64.799 + 0.256 + 0.177. The constant was 64.799, indicating that if the academic supervision and teacher working group are 0, then the teacher pedagogical competence is 64.799. The coefficient was positive, indicating a positive relationship between the variable of academic supervision and the teacher working group.

The results of multiple correlation analysis showed that the R number was 0.415. This illustrates that there was a moderate relationship between academic supervision and teacher working group on teacher pedagogical competence. Meanwhile, the results of the determination analysis obtained the number R2 (R Square) of 0.172 or 17.2%. These results illustrate that the effect of the variable of academic supervision and teacher working group on the variable of teacher pedagogical competence was 17.2%. Meanwhile, the remaining 82.8% was influenced by other variables not included in this research model.

The results of the F test analysis show that F count for 18,755 with a confidence level of 95%, a = 5%, df 1 (number of variables-1) = 1, and df 2 (nk-1) or 155-2-1 = 152. F Table was 3.90. The value of F count > F table (18,755 > 3.93) or sig 0.000<0.05. The results of the F test analysis of academic supervision and teacher working group on teacher pedagogical competence illustrate that there was a significant influence between the academic supervision by school principal and teacher working group simultaneously on teacher pedagogical competences. This shows that the higher the implementation of academic supervision and teacher working group, the teacher pedagogical competence will increase.

Based on the results of the t-test analysis, the t count was 4.322. The distribution of t table at a was 5%: 2 = 2.5% (2-sided test) with (df) n-k-1 or 155-2-1 = 152. With a 2-sided test (significance of 0.025), the t-table was 2.23. For the value of t-count of 4.322 > t table of 2.23, then Ho was rejected. The results of the t-test above illustrate that partially, there was a significant influence between academic supervision on teacher pedagogical competence. Meanwhile, testing the regression coefficient of the teacher working group variable on the pedagogical ompetence of the teacher, the t count was 3.072. The t distribution table was sought at a = 5 % : 2= 2.5 % (2-sided test) with (df) n-k-1 or 155-2-1 = 152. With a 2-sided test (significance of 0.025), the results were obtained t-table of 2.23 since the t count was 3.072>t table 2.23, then Ho was rejected. From the results of the t-test above, it can be seen that there was a partially significant effect of the teacher working group on teacher pedagogical competence.

#### Discussion

#### 1) Implementation of Academic Supervision by School Principal

The school principal in fostering teachers through supervision has a very strategic position to improve the professionalism and pedagogical competence of teachers. The school principal is expected to be able to guide, assist, foster, and encourage teachers in solving learning problems they face. However, based on the results of the study, it was found that the academic supervision carried out by elementary school principals was still classified as moderate. This proves that the implementation of academic supervision has not met expectations.

These results might have an impact on increasing teacher professionalism as explained by the results of Reitzug's analysis which concluded that the supervisor in carrying out the task is described as an expert and superior, while a teacher is described as a deficient individual who requires expert assistance (Reitzug, 2001). Assistance can be provided effectively when the supervisor has an understanding of the concepts and theory of supervision and can apply this theory in carrying out duties as a supervisor to increase teacher professionalism (Aulia Riski, 2019).

Regulation of the Minister of National Education No 41 of 2007 concerning Process Standards in Primary and Secondary Education, emphasizes the importance of supervision in schools. It is emphasized that the supervision activities carried out by the teacher starting from the planning, implementation, and assessment stages of learning outcomes. Supervision can be done by giving examples, discussions, training, and consultations (Mendiknas RI, 2013).

Several factors cause the implementation of academic supervision is not maximized. One of which is because the supervisor does not have the expected competence as a prerequisite for implementing academic supervision. Furthermore, many administrative tasks have to be completed by the supervisor. Moreover, supervision has not been programmed in a participatory manner. Besides, there is a lack of knowledge and understanding of supervision, both concepts, theory, and practice of supervision, and a lack of supervisor's understanding of the substance-related to the field of supervision (Rahabav, 2016).

#### 2) Teacher Working Group (KKG)

Based on the findings of this study, it was found that the KKG activities were not as expected. The effective implementation of KKG activities might greatly help increase the ability of teachers if they are managed properly and professionally. Teachers who are involved in KKG activities are expected to increase their knowledge, understanding, insight, and skills. Thus, it makes it easier for them to carry out tasks. In carrying out their duties and functions, teachers are required to have basic provisions and abilities known as the four basic teacher competencies (Lubis, 2017).

The findings of Lubis's research concluded that KKG/MGMP (Teacher Working Group/ Teachers Professional Development Forum) is a platform that can be used by teachers to increase knowledge, add insight, and solve the problems at hand. This is done because KKG/MGMP activities can help teachers to increase knowledge, understanding, and insight. Thus, teachers are expected to be able to solve the problems faced if KKG/MGMP activities are managed properly and professionally (Lubis, 2017).

### 3) The Effect of Academic Supervision by School Principal and Teacher Working Group (KKG) on Teacher Pedagogical Competence

Academic supervision and activities at the KKG have contributed positively to improving teacher pedagogical competence. Therefore, teacher competence can be developed properly if academic supervision by the school principal can be carried out effectively without neglecting other main tasks such as duties in the field of administration, management, and entrepreneurship. Moreover, collaboration with the existing teaching professional institution is required. One of the institutions as a forum for elementary school teachers to gather to develop their competence both professional competence and pedagogical competence is the Teacher Working Group (KKG).

Several previous studies describe that in general teachers feel the principal's performance as an academic supervisor is only focused on making assessments and finding fault on teacher performance, especially from the administrative aspect, instead of providing assistance, guidance, and strengthening the capacity of teachers in carrying out their professional duties. As a result, teacher behaviors such as rigidness, fear of supervisors, not having the courage to take the initiative, waiting for instructions, and other bureaucratic attitudes result from supervisor behavior. Such teacher behavior results in the low quality of work they display. Teachers sometimes position themselves to always accept instruction for activities that are not wrong according to the supervisor (Gunawan, 2016), (Rahabav, 2016), (Borders, 2014). Meanwhile, based on the determination test, it was found that the percentage contribution of the influence of the variables of academic supervision and KKG

activities on the variable of teacher pedagogical competence was 17.2%. Meanwhile, the remaining 82.8% was influenced by other variables.

Taking into account the results of the data analysis above, it appears that teachers still need guidance, especially regarding knowledge, concepts, and teaching skills through academic supervision and KKG activities. In line with these findings. Sukmandari's research results concluded that the existence of the KKG/MGMP forum enables teachers to have a place to consult and exchange ideas with other teachers (colleagues), and can act as instructors/facilitators in the same field as an effort to improve their competence (PPs MP IKIP PGRI Semarang, 2013).

Furthermore, teachers are expected to continue to strive to improve the quality of learning by adding and trying new learning strategies and methods for students. Academic supervision carried out by the school principal and the activities carried out at the KKG are expected to be able to explore teachers' new ideas about their duties and functions as educators, as well as understand the impact of the implementation of learning on changes in schools and communities to deepen and strengthen their competence and beliefs as an educator.

This shows that academic supervision and KKG can be the media for improving teacher competence and professionalism, both competence in learning knowledge, learning processes, scientific development, and development of teacher academic abilities as well as facilitating activities that are centered on solving learning problems and increasing competence and teacher profession.

Considering that academic supervision and the Teacher Working Group (KKG) have a positive effect on improving teacher pedagogical competence, the education office as an institution that fosters supervisors needs to pay more attention to the implementation of the school principal duties of the principal as a supervisor. Besides, it is necessary to encourage teachers to be more active in activities carried out in the KKG forum.

### **CONCLUSIONS AND SUGGESTIONS**

Academic supervision carried out by the principal shows the highest percentage in the moderate category of 89.7%. These results illustrate that the academic supervision has not

been maximized for it is in the moderate category. The Teacher Working Group (KKG) activities show a high percentage of 90.3% in the high category. Moreover, the teacher pedagogical competence shows the highest percentage of 95.5% in the moderate category. Therefore, it can be stated that academic supervision and teacher working groups have not been carried out as expected.

There is a significant influence between academic supervision and the teacher working group simultaneously on teacher pedagogical competence. This proves that the implementation of academic supervision and teacher working group (KKG) activities needs to be carried out optimally by the school principal and teachers to improve teacher pedagogical competence.

## REFERENCES

- Al Rasyid, H. (2015). Fungsi Kelompok Kerja Guru Bagi Pengembangan Keprofesionalan Guru Sekolah Dasar. *Sekolah Dasar*.
- <sup>9</sup>Asrini, K. J., Sujana, E., & Darmawan, N. A. S. (2014). Pengaruh Tekanan Waktu, Locus Of Control Dan Tindakan Supervisi Terhadap Penghentian Prematur Atas Prosedur Audit. Journal S1 Ak Universitas Pendidikan Ganesha Jurusan Akuntansi Program S1.
- Aulia Riski. (2019). Supervisi Akademik Kepala Sekolah. Journal of Chemical Information and Modeling. https://doi.org/10.1017/ CBO9781107415324.004
- Blandford, S. (2014). Managing Professional Development in Schools. In *Managing Professional Development in Schools*. https://doi.org/10.4324/9780203021606
- <sup>15</sup>Borders, L. D. (2014). Best practices in clinical supervision: Another step in delineating effective supervision practice. *American Journal* of *Psychotherapy*. https://doi.org/10.1176/appi.psychotherapy .2014.68.2.151
- Cleary, M. (2019). Supervisi Pendidikan (Teori dan Praktek dalam Mengembangkan SDM Guru). Journal of Chemical Information and Modeling.
- Dangara, Y. (2015). The Impact of Instructional Supervision on Academic Performance of Secondary School Students in Nasarawa State. *Journal of Education and Practice*.

- Faiqoh, D. (2019). Supervisi Kepala Madrasah untuk Meningkatkan Profesionalisme Guru. Jurnal Kependidikan. https://doi.org/ 10.24090/jk.v7i1.1938
- Gumiarta, I. W. (2019). Penggunaan Pendekatan Ilmiah dan Pendekatan Klinis dengan Supervisi Pengajaran untuk Meningkatkan Kemampuan Guru dalam Melakukan Inovasi Proses Pembelajaran, Penilaian Hasil Belajar, Evaluasi Proses Pembelajaran dan Tindak Lanjut Pelaksanaan Proses Pembel. Journal of Education Action Research. https://doi.org/10.23887/jear.v3i4.21802
- Gunawan, I. (2016). Pendekatan Alternatif Dalam Pelaksanaan Supervisi Pengajaran. Premiere Educandum : Jurnal Pendidikan Dasar Dan Pembelajaran. https://doi.org/ 10.25273/pe.v1i02.42
- Jahanian, R., & Ebrahimi, M. (2013). Principles for Educational Supervision and Guidance. *Journal of Sociological Research*. https://doi.org/10.5296/jsr.v4i2.4562
- Jurotun, Samsudi, & Prihatin, T. (2015). Model Supervisi Akademik Terpadu Berbasis Pemberdayaan MGMP untuk Meningkatkan Kompetensi Pedagogik Guru Matematika. Jurnal Penelitian Tindakan Sekolah Dan Kepengawasan.
- <sup>5</sup> Kotirde, I. Y., & Yunos, J. B. M. (2015). The Processes of Supervisions in Secondary Schools Educational System in Nigeria. *Procedia - Social and Behavioral Sciences*. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.sbspro.2015.08.14 9
- Lubis, S. (2017). Peningkatan Profesionalisme Guru PAI Melalui Kelompok Kerja Guru (KKG). Jurnal Pendidikan Agama Islam Al-Thariqah. https://doi.org/10.25299/althariqah.2017.v ol2(2).1045
- <sup>12</sup>Mendiknas RI. (2013). Peraturan Menteri Pendidikan Nasional Republik Indonesia Nomor 41 Tahun 2007 Tentang Standar Proses. *Journal of Chemical Information and Modeling*. https://doi.org/10.1017/ CBO9781107415324.004
- Muslim. (2017). <sup>10</sup>eran Supervisi Pengawas Madrasah dalam Meningkatkan Mutu Pendidikan: Studi pada Madrasah Aliyah Negeri 3 Kabupaten Tasikmalaya.

Indonesian Journal of Education Management and Administration Review.

- PPs MP IKIP PGRI Semarang, S. (2013). Pengaruh Motivasi Berprestasi Dan Partisipasi Guru Dalam Mgmp Terhadap Kompetensi Profesional Guru Matematika Smp Di Kabupaten Jepara. Jurnal Manajemen Pendidikan (JMP). https://doi.org/10.26877/jmp.v1i3.395
- <sup>3</sup> Rafferty, A. E., & Restubog, S. L. D. (2011). The influence of abusive supervisors on followers' organizational citizenship behaviours: The hidden costs of abusive supervision. British Journal of Management. https://doi.org/10.1111/ j.1467- 8551.2010.00732.x
- Rahabav, P. (2016). The Effectiveness of academic supervision for teachers. *Journal* of Education and Practice.
- Reitzug, U. C. (1997). Images of principal instructional leadership: From supervision to collaborative inquiry. *Journal of Curriculum and Supervision*.
- Republik Indonesia. (2005). Undang-Undang Nomor 14 Tahun 2005 tentang Guru dan Dosen. In *Sekretariat Negara*.
- Sabandi, A. (2013). Supervisi Pendidikan Untuk Pengembangan Profesionalitas Guru Berkelanjutan. *Jurnal Ilmiah Ilmu Pendidikan*.
- Zanders, M. G., Lukmansyah, D., Danniarti, R., & Moh. Rois, Fartika Ifriqia, D. S. (2017). Jurnal Manajemen, Kepemimpinan, dan Supervisi Pendidikan Volume 1, No. 1, Juli-Desember 2017. American Journal of Education.
- Sergiovanni, T. J. (2013). Leadership as pedagogy, capital development, and school effectiveness. In Educational Management: Major Themes in Education. https://doi.org/10.4324/9780203463383
- <sup>1</sup>Slameto, S. (2016). SUPERVISI PENDIDIKAN OLEH PENGAWAS SEKOLAH. Kelola: Jurnal Manajemen Pendidikan. https://doi.org/10.24246/j.jk.2016.v3.i2.p1 92-206

Sugiyono. (2014). Metode Penelitian Pendidikan pendekatan Kuantitatif, Kualitatif dan R&D. In *METODE PENELITIAN ILMIAH*.

<sup>4</sup>repper, B. J., Moss, S. E., & Duffy, M. K. (2011).

## 25 | Vol 7 No 1, April 2021

Predictorsofabusivesupervision:Supervisorperceptionsofdeep-leveldissimilarity,relationshipconflict,andsubordinateperformance.Academy ofManagementJournal.https://doi.org/10.5465/AMJ.2011.602630

85

Yunus, G. A., Lestari, W., & Raharjo, T. J. (2016). Pengembangan Model Supervisi Akademik Berbasis Evaluasi Diri bagi Guru SMA. *Educational Management*.

# turnitin<sup>®</sup>

# • 11% Overall Similarity

Top sources found in the following databases:

- 10% Internet database
- Crossref database
- 7% Submitted Works database
- 5% Publications database
- Crossref Posted Content database

## TOP SOURCES

The sources with the highest number of matches within the submission. Overlapping sources will not be displayed.

lib.unnes.ac.id	1%
Universitas Sembilanbelas November Kolaka on 2022-10-28 Submitted works	1%
repo.bunghatta.ac.id	<1%
David Van Fleet, Len White, Ella W. Van Fleet. "Baseballs or Cricke Crossref	et Ball <1%
<b>ejournal.undiksha.ac.id</b> Internet	<1%
<b>pdfs.semanticscholar.org</b> Internet	<1%
Novi Rozalita Ar, Nurhizrah Gistituati, Rusdinal Rusdinal. "Hubung <sup>Crossref</sup>	Jan Ke <1%
<b>xjournals.com</b> Internet	<1%

# turnitin

9	Fitria Magdalena Suprapto. "Machiavellian Sebagai Variabel Moderasi Crossref	<1%
10	journal.uin-alauddin.ac.id	<1%
11	journal.um.ac.id	<1%
12	ejournal.upi.edu Internet	<1%
13	ejournal.unida.gontor.ac.id	<1%
14	<b>ejournal.unisba.ac.id</b> Internet	<1%
15	RMIT University on 2019-12-03 Submitted works	<1%

# turnitin<sup>®</sup>

<ul> <li>Excluded from Similarity Report</li> <li>Small Matches (Less then 20 words)</li> <li>Manually excluded sources</li> </ul>	
EXCLUDED SOURCES	
ojs.unm.ac.id	97%
LL DIKTI IX Turnitin Consortium Part IV on 2021-11-05 Submitted works	6%
atlantis-press.com	6%
garuda.kemdikbud.go.id	5%
index.pkp.sfu.ca	5%
garuda.ristekbrin.go.id	5%
download.atlantis-press.com	5%
LL DIKTI IX Turnitin Consortium Part IV on 2021-11-12 Submitted works	4%
eprints.unm.ac.id	2%