Article Evaluation Form

EnvironmentAsia Journal

Article Title MAPPING AND ZONATION LEVEL OF LANDSLIDE HAZARD AND RISK ASSESSMENT IN ENREKANG REGENCY

1. General Information

Name of Reviewer KRITTAYAPORN CHAROENPOL…………… Revision Return Date   ………………………..

Reviewer's affiliation

……………………………………………………………………………………….…………………………

……….

2. Policy Article publishable in EnvironmentAsia should have clear, concise, and complete contents. It should also contain academic value and never been published elsewhere.

3. Score Level (Please evaluate the following statements by checking the appropriate box)

Criteria	Poor	Fair	Average	good	Excellent
1. Rationale			/		
2. Academic Value			/		
3. Completeness of content and structure		/			
4. Language			/		
5. Clearness of hypothesis and objectives			/		
6. Presentation and organization of research works			/		
7. Correctness of the content		/			
8. Discussion		/			
9. Reference and citation		/			

4. Comment and suggestion   Please provide detailed comments, advices and suggestions based on your professional expertise to help authors improve thair papers in separate page.

5. Recommendation (Please make a recommendation by checking the appropriate box)

☐ 1. Accept as is

☐ 2. Accept with minor revision

/ 3. Major revision

☐ 4. Reject

Signature   Date   9/01/2018

The information in this page is confidential and not provided the authors.

Reviewer's Comments and Suggestions

EnvironmentAsia Journal

Consideration Issue	Cooments/Suggestion for improvement
1. Title	-It can be added the information of Enrekang Regency, where is the location or it can specific the study area by using the words "A case study of Enerkang Regency districts, South Sulawesi, Indonesia"
2. Abstract	-The researcher need to add some information about the accuracy of the output map and it needs to show the performance of the technique to derive the risk of landslide mapping.
3. Introduction	- …… … …… …. …… …
4. Materials and Methods	-The steps of methodology can be presented by using the flowchart, it will show the process and it is easy to summarize the framework of this paper. -The scoring and weighting factors are the importance parts to analyse the GIS technique, therefore, it can be retrieved from the other journals or the experts and it must to reference the sources why you use this values in your paper? (I think it is the first time to product the risk zonation map at Enerkang Regency district. Thus, the researcher can be proposed the method to extract the scoring/weighting factors, which it suitable for this study site). -It is not clear about the methodology to determine the score and weighting factors. It can be shown the technique to assign the scoring and weighting factors in each of parameters ie. the pairwise comparison technique or other approach. -The class intervals can be assigned in different method. For example it can be used mean and standard deviation of the histogram of IRL or any statistic values and it will be appropriated than

	use the simple method by using the same value-1.3)
	-The researcher need to demonstrate the accuracy of the map which calculated from GIS technique, it can be compared the output map with the reliable sources or field survey data.
5. Results	-The researcher should to mention the development of scoring and weighting values in each of factors for clearing the ideas. For example, why the weighting value of landforms is the same as the gradient of slope? Why land use data is the lowest significant factor to compare with landforms and slope? (It must to clear the scoring and weighting values in each of factors or show the evident) - The maps are not clear in detail. Could you please provide the new one with high resolution?
6. Discussion and conclusion	The topic 4 and 5 should be the sub-topic within the result and discussion.
7. References and citations	-Please check the format of references and citations (text, journal, website etc.) and arrange by the alphabet. -Please check the missing reference in this paper.
8. Others	-Please check the spelling, vocabulary and grammar.