Value System in the Context of Woman Leader's Decision Making

1st Jetty Erna Hilda Mokat
State Administration Studies Program
Faculty of Social Sciences, Universitas
Negeri Manado,
Manado, Indonesia
jettymokat@yahoo.co.id

2nd Rifdan
Faculty of Social Sciences
Universitas Negeri Makassar
Makassar, Indonesia
rifdan@unm.ac.id

3rd Andi Ima Kesuma
Fakultas Ilmu Sosial
Universitas Negeri Makassar
Makassar, Indonesia
andiimakesuma@yahoo.com

4th Itje Pangkey
State Administration Studies Program
Faculty of Social Sciences, Universitas
Negeri Manado,
Manado, Indonesia
itjepangkey@unima.ac.id

5th Jeane E. Langkai
State Administration Studies Program
Faculty of Social Sciences, Universitas
Negeri Manado,
Manado, Indonesia
Jeanelangkai@unima.ac.id

6th Thelma Wawointana
Public Administration Study Program
Faculty of Social Science
Universitas Negeri Manado
Manado, Sulawesi Utara
thelmawawointana@unima.ac.id

Abstract - This research aims to analyze the value system as the determinant of women leader's decision making. Qualitative approach was used, with case study research type. The data were collected through observation, thoughtful interview and documentation. Data analysis technique used interactive analysis model according to Miles and Huberman. The findings of this study showed that women leader's decision making is dilemmatic (there is a tendency on listening to people suggestion that came out of the organization such prayer team and ignoring the suggestion from the underlings), making religious value as the reference and ignoring the cultural value. This research recommends further research to be conducted on women's role in practice politic.

Keywords - value system, women leadership, determinant of decision making.

I. INTRODUCTION

The existence of woman in public sphere has not fully gain support, included from the woman herself. Woman position as a leader still emerge controversy from the various realms. Woman included as marginalized subordinate group, even though the total population of woman are more dominant than man. This situation signaling that there is still an imbalance proportion between man and woman leader. The characteristics that inherent with woman such as: prioritizing feeling, less rational, and weak creature were becoming the reasons that woman unfeasible or less deserve to pace on public realm which full of challenge especially duty and responsible of a leader that were really complex. This perspective also that caused women are difficult to occupy the eminent position in governmental organization either politics and inclined to be subordiante. It is shall be admitted that in occupying leader position moreover becoming public leader, since it eventually means they have to deal with the very complex duty and responsible. One of leader's duties is making decision. Since the position of this leader that will lead them becoming the executor of authority and making organization decision.

Generally, the leader of governmental organization dominated by man, even though there is no any regulation that the leader should be a man. Whether it is woman or man both are possessed the equal opportunity. No matter how great a leader there is always

a weakness. Currently, woman has proved to be able to occupy the position on the top. This truth is inevitable and must be on recognized that woman deserves occupying leader position, despite the quantity of woman representation in public realm incomparable to the man. Despite there is an increasing quantity of woman that occupying leader position, gender problem unfortunately unresolved yet, for there are still found so many discrepancies even gender has come to global issue, especially in developing countries including Indonesia.

Basically, the achievement of gender-based establishment had experienced a development. Nationally, Human Development Index (IPM) of woman and man had increased. Woman IPM even a little exceeded to man, nevertheless, it is remaining unable to resolve the discrepancy such as low participation of a woman, injustice, inequality, even imbalance in obtaining an opportunity especially in governmental and politic realm. There is stil an opinion that ''women are merely house wife that unfeasible to get into political realm'' [1], there is even a perspective that a leader is "*male type*" [2]. The phenomenon which occurred caused by gender bias that either still causing gender comprehension remain narrow, such: labeling, marginalizing and subordinating the woman.

Gender commonly regards with sex (male or female). Gender and sex interpreted as the difference between man and woman. The term of sex refers to biological distinction, meanwhile gender refer to social construction concerned with role, duty, and position of woman and man. Oakley somehow asserted by Relawati that "gender term is the habitual behavior distinction between man and woman which socially constructed, that made by woman and man themselves, that is part of culture. The difference between woman and man according to gender were based values and norms that is prevailed in society, so that gender construction can be different among group of society one another" [3]. The labeling that mended towards woman still colouring organization movement, it is less likely public leader position fit for woman especially as *top leader* causing there are a lot of woman becoming inconfident and finally affected on woman participation in public realm classified as the low one and not as expected.

Selena Resvani really believes that leadership will remain move forward in gender perspective. Pros and cons about the presence of a woman as a leader caused by its gender concept comprehension as well [4]. Although there is still stigma that woman is unfit to pace in public realm for the characteristics that adhered with woman, but it is must be admitted that woman has

surplus and ability as complementer of necessity in this era. This concept of gender was really influenced by various factors, such value system, like religious value, social and cultural value. This condition that was also caused occupation, function and role between man and woman in a particular region different from other regions as well.

As the time went by, with the rapid development of technology and science it has been influencing the attitude and mind set of the people. Gender bias that causing various phenomenon in society such subordinating, marginalizing, and labeling in fact does not decrease the courage and womens's will to pace in public realm. Instead, woman got more triggered and challenged that they keep on attempting to increase skill and strengthen quality through education. Even more motivated to develop themselves by showing achievements and talents, so that woman leader in public realm more and more counted. The woman even remains attempt to positioning herself to be equal to men without has to omit herself identity. The leader position is the crucial factor and determining in an organization. The key of success of an organization is unseparable with the leadership.

According to Yulk leadership concerns with the process that intentionally by oneself to affirm his/her strong influence towards others to guide, make structure, facilitating activity and the relationship in the group or organization [5]. Leadership in this case more emphasized on the ability to influence people that being led and conducting organization activity. That means, leadership is an influencing activity from a leader that directed to achieve organization objective. Meanwhile leader in governmental circle were the people that being raised to occupy a position because of reputed as the ones that possessed ability in running leadership according to the authority that being given.

Since the presence of a leader is crucial and meaningful in an organization that Keith Davis affirm that without leader, an organization will merely remain a mingled of human and tools [6]. It is getting clearer that leader possesses a crucial role in determining direction, aim, and continuation of the organization. Therefore, in becoming a successful leader demanded qualified leader that was not merely posses manangerial ability but also posses superiority in carrying organization to achieve its objective.

Reference [7] asserted that a leader needs to posses a surplus, a line with Wahjosumijo as explained by Sudriamunawar that a leader requires a set of surpluses like: 1) capacity; 2) achievement; 3) responsible; 4) participation; 5) status; and 6), one needs to posses a prestige, various accolades/superiorities and ability that exceeded the people that being led. Such as situation [6]. It means a leader supposed to posses' adequate knowledge, responsible, intelligent, along with enthusiast working and skills that may sustain his/her activity. This was meant to make a leader posseses surpluses compare to those that being led, since personal quality of a leader depicted on the conspicuous characteristics of a leader. Whether qualified or not, a leader can also be seen in decision making. The surplus that he/she possessed, reflected his/her authority as a leader, since main criteria that recognizing oneself becoming a leader were not considering the descendant. Furthermore, in order to know the success of an organization it is very closely related to the effectivity of leadership.

The effectivity of one's leadership is determined by factor of cultural value system that embraced by society. "cultural value system consists of concepts that live in the conscience nature of several people, concern with things that supposed to be seen as valuable one in life. Thus, cultural value system commonly functioned as the highest guideline for human behaviour" [8]. The life of Minahasa people were inseparable with ''*mapalus*'' cultural value system. In *mapalus* occasionally contained a very influencial values on the increase and development of leadership and the life of Minahasa people.

Mapalus is an organization, that is in its development affected towards various aspect of society's life priory to increase welfare. Narrowly, the essence of mapalus is the willingness to cooperate voluntarily between people in a social, religious and cultural work group or organization. In essence mapalus has the same meaning as mutual cooperation, but in its development has a broader meaning, including "help help", for example, helping in working on gardens to build houses and so on. Furthermore "mapalus is an expression of the Minahasan people's view of life as a sense of mutual responsibility in the order of life of a democratic society" [9]. The life of democratic society is manifested in the attitude of help, deliberation, strict discipline, and the equal status of men and women.

As the local discretion, mapalus is one of the cultural dimensions that posseses relevant values in carrying out tasks in governmental fields, development and society to design success. Mapalus values have a very deep meaning that influences leadership practices in Minahasa, and becomes a strengthening of leadership in governmental institutions in attempt to improve the quality of work. So mapalus institution is not merely a social work institution, but an institution that seeks to develop achievement, a dynamic work ethic, and quality. The pursuit of success, achievement and quality in mapalus work ethics is inseparable from the central view of the Minahasa community based on the philosophy of life of the community, namely: "the tou timou tumou tou" (a living person to help others to live).

For Minahasa people, to gain leadership legitimacy, a leader must have certain qualities and achievements in the community. Leader quality is measured from: 1) nga'asan (meaning have an expertise), 2) niaten, meaning having a heart = having courage, perseverance and tenacity facing a problem), and 3) a march that is strong and reliable [10]. Furthermore, according to Tilaar, the quality of ownership inherent in Minahasa people is: 1) a leader has prominent personal qualities (mastery of a science, physical strength or life experience. Ability is the main criterion that enters him as a leader); 2) high appreciation is given to one's experience. A person is appointed as a leader or gets the legitimacy of his leadership because he has an achievement in the community and has a higher level of quality. This level of quality is the source of authority [9].

Based on these two opinions, it suggests that being a leader for the Minahasa community is not an easy thing because of the complex criteria that must be met. The point is that a person who can be called as a leader is someone who has the expertise, knowledge, courage, skills, tenacity, experience and outstanding achievements in society. These surpluses are considered as authority that can legitimize one's leadership.

Southeast Minahasa is one of the areas in North Sulawesi Province which rarely disputing the position of distinction between men and women, including being a public leader. Men and women have the same opportunity to be leaders. Successful leaders are not determined by gender, but by leadership values that are based more on basic talents, skills and potential, which encourages women to put attempt on occupying leadership positions. The leader is an intelligent person, has the ability to lead exceedingly than the others has. As rational beings and have the same abilities as men, women also need to get the equivalent treatment. Especially for the majority of Minahasa religious people who do not limit or prohibit women from becoming leaders, because being a leader means serving. The main measurement is the readiness and the intellectual possessed can support their duties and responsibilities as leaders.

Some female leaders and leaders who can be role model by being able to elevate the ranks of Minahasa people in general and women in particular, among others: Maria Walanda-Maramis is an observer of women's social status, Tine Waworuntu as the first Indonesian woman's mayor in 1950, and Agustina Zus Ratulangi, the youngest female member of parliament in Indonesia. In addition, there are several Regencies and Cities in North Sulawesi Province that have been and are being led by a woman, among others: North Minahasa, South Minahasa, and Southeast Minahasa.

The inherent characteristics of women and so far are seen as weaknesses, precisely by the Minahasa community as an advantage that can motivate and even challenge women to take part in the public sphere. This also causes Minahasa women to be categorized as brave, have high self-confidence, are always optimistic and feel that they are no less competitive with men to achieve strategic positions as top leaders because they feel they have reliable potential.

The Regional Head Regent in accordance with his position is the top leader, who in the administration of functions and tasks of the government has the authority or authority which attached to the position, including policy makers and decision makers. The decision of the leader has consequences that greatly determine the survival of the organization. Effective, creative, and good quality of leadership does depend on the ability and decision-making style of leaders. According to Effendi as explained by Ardana Komang et al that the influential forces in decision making are individual dynamics, group dynamics, influence of environmental norms and dynamics [11]. Furthermore, James Anderson developed by Wahab emphasized that values that can help and direct the behavior of decision makers are: 1) Political Values; 2) Organizational Values; 3) Personal Values; 4) Policy Values; and 5) Ideological Values [12]. Meanwhile, according to Gibson et al, the determinant factors of decision making are: values, personality, tendency to take risks and potential nonconformities [13]. This study focused on value / value factors in the context of women's leaders' decision making. Value / value in this case is a guide when a leader must make decisions among several choices. Decision making in this regard is ethical according to the values possessed by the leader, guided by noble values and meeting community standards.

II. RESEARCH METHODS

This research was conducted in the Southeast Minahasa District of North Sulawesi Province, qualitative approach with type of case study research was used. The aim of the study was to analyze the value system as one of the determinants in the decision making of women leaders. Research data sources included primary and secondary data sources. Primary data were obtained from informants selected by purposive sampling which included: Regional Secretary, Head of Office / Head of Agency, Inspectorate, Section Head, Community Leader, Religious Leader, DPRD member and Non-Governmental Organization (NGO). Whereas secondary data obtained through documentation studies in the form of written materials include: Regional Regulation on Changing Regional Symbols. Data collection was conducted through literature studies, observations, thoughtful interviews and documentation. The collected data was checked by triangulation. The data analysis technique used was descriptive qualitative with an interactive analysis model from Miles and Huberman [14].

III. RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

In accordance with the problems, this research is focused on the decision-making value system. Values are basic guidelines and adhered beliefs, social and cultural values of the community along with procedural requirements and prior commitments. The findings and results of the study indicate that: first, the decision of the female leader (Bupati) is often controversial, thus reaping resistance from the community. This happens because the regent as the decision maker does not consider and even ignore the aspects of values / values that apply in society, especially the cultural values of "mapalus". The "mapalus" values are values that are upheld by society, are basic attitudes that are owned and are a moral dimension that binds the behavior of individuals and Minahasa society. The values that should be a strengthening of leadership in government institutions are not appreciated or even ignored. Neglecting these values, for instance, appears in decisions about the change of symbol of the Southeast Minahasa region

which are only unilateral decisions and lack of subordinates and community leaders' engagement.

Actions and attitudes of the regent who are firm in the stand to make changes to regional symbols and reap resistance are not actually aspects that substance does not even need to be done. There are still many issues that are far more important and require urgent resolution and handling. Such attitudes and actions show an attitude that does not respect the cultural values of the Minahasa community. Organizational values, democratic values, policy values, and ideological values that should be used as a basis for action are not considered. While ideological values also require that its implementation respects local cultural values as well as the intent and purpose of granting autonomy to the region.

Based on the findings and research results, the idea of changing the symbol of the Southeast Minahasa region was not born from the wishes of the community, but from the person of the regent on the input of the prayer team formed. Basically, to change regional symbols requires the involvement of various parties to consider internal and external factors, including the philosophy that is upheld by the community, the social and cultural values of the community and the existing regulations. Philosophy related to the aspect of value is difficult to measure, but becomes a force for society. The philosophy of the Minahasa community is illustrated in "Mapalus".

Mapalus has a very deep meaning in people's lives, and is an expression of the Minahasa people's view of life as a crystallization of the community value system, influencing the efforts of developing local government leadership. McFarland as explained again by Djatmiko that philosophy as an internal factor is very decisive because it deals with personal factors [15][. Personal attitudes that are firm, hard and tend to be authoritarian which is reflected in the actions of the regent is one of the consequences of not involving subordinates in decision making. Minahasa people who do not know social classes find it difficult to accept forced powers that are irrational, especially regarding the interests of many people.

Controversy and resistance due to the decision to change regional symbols, were not able to shake the attitude of the regent. Its strength can be seen in the attitude that remains at the establishment, even though the action is contradict to the expectations of society and the rules that apply. The symbol of the Southeast Minahasa region "Burung Manguni" in it contains the noble values of the Minahasa culture known as "PATOKAN ESA" and eventually changes. Benchmarks are the acronyms of ethnic Pasan, Tonsawang, and Ponosakan; whereas Esa means one goal, replaced by the symbol of the recovery "Pigeon Bird" which no longer describes the ethnicity. A value system that touches the most basic of people's lives and resonates in mapalus life arrangements, such as: the value of togetherness, objectivity, deliberation, and work ethics does not get attention. Lack of attention to efforts to study the values of mapalus culture in the context of leadership has resulted in resistance to the leadership of the female regent government in Southeast Minahasa District, thus impacting on not being elected again in the next period.

Second, religious values / beliefs that are embraced / believed to be the main reference in decision making, in addition to political values and personal values. Political values appear in decisions related to the policies and interests of the bearer party. While personal values are more visible in the decisions taken in an effort to protect the reputation, position and interests of the group. Decision makers choose alternatives based on judgment on importance or not; and mean or not the choice. In accordance with the findings of the study: attitudes, intuition and beliefs adopted by decision makers become the basis for alternative selection because they believe that being a leader is a "call" to serve. Whereas the rules that should be a guideline or a basis for acting for a public leader (government) are ruled out so as to cause pros and cons.

Longman Karen et al in the research on "Conceptualization of Calling", among others, focused on "the role of female leadership

call" explaining that theological influences, family realities, cultural expectations, and living conditions are contextual factors that encourage women to pursue talents and talents as a call [16]. Longman Karen et al's research has similarities with the findings of this study, especially theological and family factors, but what distinguishes it is in the leadership of the female regents in Southeast Minahasa who do not pay attention to even ignore the cultural values of society.

It's very different from the previous and after leadership who are men. "The difference between female and male leaders is the fact that a female leader acts less responsive than a male leader. Female leader (the regent) often connects religious views which is based love and duty government which is based on formal rules" [17]. The influence of the Prayer Team and even dominating the leadership of the female regent in Southeast Minahasa was closely related to the background of the regent as an evanglish, so that in the administration of the government led to leadership with the Theological system of governance.

The values of beliefs adopted and viewed as sensitive, not only become strengths and motivations for decision makers but also become basic guidelines [13], and values can help direct the behavior of decision makers, including political values, policy values; and ideological values and personal values [12]. This study confirms the importance of values in the decision making of a leader. Values can be a benchmark in determining alternative choices and become the strength of individual leaders' behavior to address various problems in government administration.

Third, decision making that is dilemmatic. The dilemma decision mainly appears in a firm, hard and authoritarian manner that is applied to subordinates; but easily influenced by people outside the structure. Usually people who tend to be authoritarian are people who are very difficult to influence. "An authoritarian leader acts very directively, always gives direction, and does not provide opportunities for participation" [18]. Leaders with this style are leaders who use their power in influencing subordinates, and less involving subordinates in decision making. It is different with the regent (female) in Southeast Minahasa, his firmness and authoritarian attitude only applies to people who are in the structure / subordinates, but do not apply to people outside the structure, namely the prayer team. So important is the involvement of subordinates in decision making that is strongly believed by Hasan Zahara and Abu Daud Silong that consensus is a very important element in achieving a decision. By providing opportunities for others to speak before a decision is made [19].

Other findings are decision making based more on feelings, not on rules; less attention to ethical values in government. Attitudes and actions shown by the regent when making decisions on one side pleases certain groups (prayer team), while on the other hand it is not pleasing to subordinates and the community. Such an attitude is an attitude that tries to please others even though they have to get out of the rules that have been set. When associated with the concepts of Hersey and Blanchard [20]] indicate that such leadership behaviors lead to concideration leadership models, by striving to show an attitude of solidarity, friendship in order to please certain people or groups. While the attitude that only listens to certain groups of people and overrides the rules shows the attitude of leaders who tend to take discretionary decisions. But the act of discretion without a legal umbrella.

Giving discretion to the government is not without limits or the government can take action freely. Because the discretion of government officials, among others, aims to smooth the administration of government, and for the benefit of society. Discretionary action of government officials must meet the requirements, such as: can be accounted for, not cause a conflict of interest, based on objective reasons, not contrary to the provisions of the legislation as expected in article 24 point (b) and (e) of Law Number 30 2014 concerning Government Administration. Discretion is not an infinite action. Markus Lukman as explained by Ridwan "Discretion is one of the means that provides a space

for the government to take action without having to be bound by the law" [21], as "the freedom possessed in exercising authority as long as it does not conflict with applicable legislation" [18] So the discretion given to government officials is intended. as a larger space to innovate for the interests and progress of the region. In practice, this opportunity has the potential to cause negative impacts that harm citizens and can conflict with the interests and rights of citizens. The implementation of discretionary power must have clear boundaries in the framework of the rule of law, able to answer the demands of public aspirations, adhering to the norms, morals and ethics that accumulate in the realization of good governance.

Leaders as executors of authority and decision makers are essentially the people who are most responsible for the success of the organization. The leader is the one who plays the most role in determining the direction for achieving organizational goals. Decision making is one of the means to achieve goals, and the success of a leader appears in the outcome of a decision. Thus, it is clear that decision making will determine the success of the organization. Therefore, the leader must have the ability and skills in determining the choice of a number of alternatives.

IV. CONCLUSION

Values are one of the factors that determine the decision making of a leader. Value is a guideline that contains the hopes and ideals that are believed to be true. And the one that most determines the evaluation and alternative selection of decision-making leaders in this case the first female regent of Southeast Minahasa is the religious / religious values she adheres to and believes. Whereas the values of mapalus culture as a value that is upheld by the people and is an expression of the Minahasan people's view of life in the living order of a democratic society are ignored, thus causing the results of the decision to reap resistance from the community and bureaucrats / subordinates in the Southeast Minahasa District government environment (especially related to changes in regional symbols) Having an attitude and personality that is firm, hard and tends to be authoritarian, but easily influenced by certain groups / prayer teams. Such personality attitudes are unique to the female regent who once led the Southeast Minahasa District. The Regent's attitude which accepts input from people outside the structure (prayer team) by putting aside the prevailing rules describes the attitude of leaders who tend to take discretionary decisions. In the administration of the government, it implements leadership that leads to the Theological system of government.

REFERENCES

[1] H. Ratu, M. Tilaar, I. Syamsi, L. Suhenti, M. S. Firmansyah, and Luviana, *Perempuan parlemen dalam cakrawala politik Indonesia*. Dian Rakyat, 2013.

[2] Wirawan, *Kepemimpinan teori, psikologi, perilaku organisasi, aplikasi dan penelitian. contoh aplikasi untuk kepemimpinan wanita, organisasi bisnis, pendidikan dan militer*. Jakarta: Raja Grafindo Persada, 2013.

[3] R. Relawati, *Konsep dan aplikasi penelitian gender*. Bandung: Muara Indah, 2011.

[4] S. Rezvani, *The next generation of woman leaders*. Jakarta: Elex Media Komputindo Kelompok Gramedia, 2013.

[5] Y. Gary, "Kepemimpinan dalam organisasi," *Jakarta PT Yudeks*, 2005.

[6] S. Haryono, "Kepemimpinan Peran Serta dan Produktivitas," *Mandar Maju, Bandung*, 2006.

[7] R. M. Stogdill and B. M. Bass, "Stogdill's handbook of leadership: a survey of theory and research revised and expanded," *Macmillan*, 1982.

[8]   Koentjaraningrat, *Kebudayaan, Mentalitet dan Pembangunan*. Jakarta: Gramedia, 1974.

[9]   H. A. R. Tilaar, "). Si Tou Timou Tumou Tou: Suatu Konsep Pembangunan Sumber Daya Manusia dalam Rangka Pembangunan Minahasa Menuju Tinggal Landas Pembangunan," Manado, 1998.

[10]   B. Supit, *Minahasa. Dari Amanat Watu Pinawetengan Sampai Gelora Minahasa*. Jakarta: Sinar Harapan, 1986.

[11]   K. Ardana, N. W. Mujiati, and A. A. A. Sriathi, "Perilaku keorganisasian," *Yogyakarta Graha Ilmu*, 2009.

[12]   S. A. Wahab, "Analisis kebijakan: dari formulasi ke penyusunan model-model implementasi kebijakan publik," *Jakarta Bumi Aksara*, 2012.

[13]   J. L. Gibson, J. M. Ivancevich, J. H. Donnelly, and R. Konopaske, *Organizations: Behavior, structure, processes*. Irwin Homewood, IL, 1991.

[14]   M. B. Miles and A. M. Huberman, "Qualitative Data Analysis (terjemahan)." Jakarta: UI Press, 2007.

[15]   F. Luthans, "Perilaku organisasi." Edisi, 2006.

[16]   K. A. Longman, J. Dahlvig, R. J. Wikkerink, D. Cunningham, and C. M. O'Connor, "Conceptualization of calling: A grounded theory exploration of CCCU women leaders," *Christ. High. Educ.*, vol. 10, no. 3–4, pp. 254–275, 2011.

[17]   H. Mokat, J. Erna, L. Lumingkewas, R. Rifdan, A. I. Kesuma, and A. I. Kesuma, "The Leadership Style of Woman as the Head of Regency in Instructing Duties and Supervision to Subordinates (The Case Study in Minahasa Tenggara Regency)," *Int. J. Humanit. Soc. Sci. Invent.*, vol. 4, no. 8, pp. 1–8, 2015.

[18]   M. Thoha, "Perilaku organisasi konsep dasar dan aplikasinya," *PT. Raja Graf. Persada, Jakarta*, 2007.

[19]   K. A. Rao, "Women leadership and community development," *Int. J. Multidiscip. Educ. Res.*, vol. 1, no. 1, pp. 193–201, 2012.

[20]   P. Hersey and K. H. Blanchard, "Management of organizational behavior: Utilizing human resources." Academy of Management Briarcliff Manor, NY 10510, 1969.

[21]   J. Ridwan and A. Sodik, *Hukum Administrasi Negara dan Kebijakan Pelayanan Publik*. Nuansa Cendekia, 2009.