

A COMPARATIVE STUDY ON SPEAKING THROUGH STORYTELLING AND ROLE PLAY OF SMP STUDENTS

Sri Wahyuni

vooneeuni845@gmail.com

Baso Jabu

basojabu@gmail.com

Kisman Salija

kismansalija@unm.ac.id

ABSTRACT

This research aimed at comparing the SMP students' speaking abilities between Storytelling and Role Play. This research tried to find out which method, Storytelling or Role Play, makes the students speaking ability more prominent and which method, Storytelling or Role Play, makes the students more interested in learning speaking. The researcher conducted the research by using quasi-experimental method and involved 19 students for experimental class 1 and 20 students for experimental class 2. The instrument used in this research were speaking test in order to know the students speaking accuracy, fluency, and comprehensibility, and questionnaire to know the students interest in both methods. The result of posttest showed that the t-value (-1.835) < t-table (2.2.26) and the p-value (0.075) > 0.05. It means that H_0 was accepted and the H_1 was rejected, or in other words, there was no significant difference on speaking through storytelling and role play of SMP students. Related with the aims of this research, the researcher state that from both methods; (1) the students' had a same speaking ability whether in storytelling or in role play (2) the students' interest was categorized in very high interest for both methods but the highest score was in Role play. It can be concluded that although the use of Storytelling and Role Play can improve the speaking skill of the students, they basically have a same level of ability and the students have more high interest in Role Play than in Storytelling.

Keywords: *Comparison Study, Speaking ability, Storytelling, Role Play*

INTRODUCTION

The development of science and technology has spread out around the countries including our country, Indonesia. As a result, people realize that the need of English as international language is high. Yunus (2012) explain in their article that the students need English not only during their

study years but also after they graduate from their school. They emphasize the need on the need for retraining of English language competency in continuing education for employees at the workplace.

Among all the English skills that the students learn during their study, speaking skill is an English skill that has a big role and become the parameters of the students' ability in English. Teaching speaking in English has been evaluated by the expert over the years, where the teachers have taught speaking in the classroom by repetition technique or memorizing the dialogues. It's clear that speaking become the real challenge to most of students in learning English. It needs big effort to use appropriate vocabularies orally in order that the message is able to understand by others correctly. The students have to be stimulated to speak English in order to build up their speaking habits. Many English teachers or facilitators make some effort to make their class interesting with various approaches, methods, technique, materials and instruments. The teachers have responsibility to create a perfect atmosphere or situation in presenting materials that provide opportunities and stimulate students to communicate actively by express their thought and feeling fluently and feel motivated in learning English. Because it's a fact that students sometimes need a high motivation to learn, especially English subject.

Bonwell & Eison in Wijaya (2014) stated that the students usually will learn more effective by analyzing, discussing, and applying the content meaningfully and actively rather than absorbing the information passively. Meyers & Jones (1993) defined the active learning as things that provide opportunities for students to talk and listen, read, write, and reflect as they approach course content. Based on these theories the researcher applied, Storytelling and Role Play, as two methods to be used and to be compared as the speaking tools to know the students speaking ability.

Based on the explanation above, the objective of the research were to find out:

1. The method between role play and storytelling making the speaking ability of the SMP students' more prominent in learning speaking.
2. The method between role play or storytelling making the students more interested in learning speaking

REVIEW OF RELATED LITERATURE

The use of storytelling and role play are consider as very popular method to use in learning English specially related with the speaking skills of the students. Lakamaruddin in Rahman R, (2014) conclude that the factors influence the students in speaking English are first psychological factors that are the students are usually ashamed, awkward, and afraid in speaking English to their partner or their teachers or to the other people. The second is cognitive factor that is the students' lack of the mastering of English grammar and vocabulary. The third factor is the words are also different to pronounce and to express their ideas in English. The last factor is the students are difficult to find out the situation in which they can practice their English more frequently.

In relation to this research, in solving those problems above, the researcher will propose alternative approaches through storytelling and role play. These two approaches will be used as methods to activate students speaking ability.

Related with the use of storytelling, studies of Ramadani A, (2015) with title "The effects of recount storytelling with guided questions on speaking ability of English Department students' at STKIP Muhammadiyah Bulukumba", found that the implication of teaching using story telling

technique with guided questions was improve the students' ability in English specially in students' speaking level ability namely accuracy, fluency, and comprehensibility level.

Juvianto (2017) in his research "The use of digital story telling in teaching listening comprehension: an experimental study of the eight grade students of SMPN 4Parepare" state that the application of digital storytelling is significantly affect the students' listening comprehension. Even though the implementation of storytelling here was used for another English skill, it shows the effectiveness of the method.

Another research was by Habirun (2014) states the using of storytelling in teaching speaking gave significant improvement in students speaking ability. He also states that the use of storytelling helped the students to improve their accuracy, fluency, and comprehensibility in speaking English. Zatriany (2016) in her research concludes that the use of role play can influence the students learning interest especially to the students who categorize had a very low interest in learning speaking. Islam & Islam (2012) state in their article that role play technique has positive impact in improving learners' speaking skills as it gives the students a chance to explore different situations of real life and make them able to speak accurately and confidently in that situation in the target language.

Although during role play in a large class room, the situation gets chaotic and the performers sometimes forget their dialogues, which create embarrassment, eventually with the help of little feedback from the teachers, this problem can be resolved. Teachers may give prompt verbal feedback or written feedback in case of technical difficulties while recording acts. Kusnierek (2015) conclude in revealed in her research that implementing role-play activities develops the students' speaking skills. Such a task is more appealing to the learners because they find it funny to play someone else's role. The majority of the students claimed that they felt that their

speaking skills increased and some students claimed that they had overcome their fear of speaking because they had quite much time devoted only to speaking in the target language.

Ozdemir (2015) also stated that storytelling technique is a powerful tool in language classes. When integrated with role playing activities, story-based lessons provide a rich exposure to comprehensible input which improves vocabulary learning. In another research, Yaghoti &Baradam (2016) found that the results showed that there is a significant difference between the effect of storytelling and role-playing on learners' motivation.

Speaking in practically is not an easy job to do because it is difficult than learning to understand the spoken language. so, it's enough for the students to hear or to listen the speech only. That's why the students are hoped to practice their English anywhere and the teacher are expected to give more attention and give various activities in teaching English, especially speaking skills.

The used of storytelling and role play as the methods in this research based on the some positive aspect of both methods. Such as, both methods are motivating and fun. These methods can attract the students' interest to make them focus. It was also believed that storytelling and role play as story-based lesson can enrich the students' vocabulary that was needed in speaking. Related with the findings above, the researcher regard both methods were used to increase the students' English skill or ability. The aims of this research were concern on comparing the speaking abilities of the students through storytelling and role play and also comparing the students' interest in both methods.

METHODS

The method that the researcher applied in this research is quasi-experimental design. It was aimed to find out the comparison of the students speaking ability in using storytelling (M1) and role play (M2). The research was conducted to the second year students of SMPN 2

Gantrangkeke that consist of 63 students. There were two classes to be used in this research and to be applied for both methods. In doing the research, the researcher determines two classes; they were class VIII A as experimental class 1 that consists of 19 students and VIII C as experimental class 2, which consists of 20 students, so the amount of sample was 39 students. The variables of the research were storytelling and role play as independent variables, the speaking skill as the dependent variables and the interest of the students as the intervening variables. The instrument used were speaking test to measure the students speaking ability and questionnaire to know the students interest in storytelling and role play. The data collected from each class will be analyzed by using the statistical package for the social science (SPSS) version 25.00 for windows.

FINDINGS AND DISCUSSION

The prominent method

The result of the pretest showed that in pretest both of groups had equals ability in speaking or we can say that the students were in the same level for their speaking ability.

Classification	Score	Storytelling		Role Play	
		Pretest			
		F	P(%)	F	P(%)
Excellent	86 – 100	0	0	0	0
Very Good	71 – 85	0	0	0	0
Good	56 – 70	2	11	3	15
Average	41 – 55	1	5	5	25
Poor	26 – 40	5	26	8	40
Very Poor	< 26	11	58	4	20
Total		19	100	20	100

Table 1. Frequency and Percentage of Pretest Score for both groups

The table 1 above showed the amount of students who got each categorize. The students' pretest score result are categorized as Good, Average, Poor, and Very Poor. In E1 class, the data shows that there were 2 (11%) students got *Good* categorize, 1 (5%) students got *Average*, 5 (26%)

students got *Poor*, and 11(58%) students got *Very Poor*. While in E2 class, there were 3 (15%) students got *Good* categorize, 5 (25%) students got *Average*, 8 (40%) students got *Poor*, and 4 (20%) students got *Very Poor*. So, even though both group classes (E1 and E2) had the same categorizes in pretest, but they were different in the most gained score level, where most of the students in Storytelling (E1) got *Very Poor*, in Role Play (E2) most of the students got *Poor* categorize.

Group Statistics

	Class	N	Mean	Std. Deviation	Std. Error Mean
Score	Storytelling	19	30.12	13.774	3.160
	Role Play	20	39.16	13.420	3.001

Table 2. The Mean Score and Standard Deviation of the students pretest.

The table 2 above was the mean score and standard deviation of the students pretest, where it showed that the mean score of Role Play was higher than Storytelling. It means that the students' ability in speaking by Role Play is higher than in Storytelling.

Independent Samples Test

		Levene's Test for Equality of Variances		t-test for Equality of Means						
		F	Sig.	t	Df	Sig. (2-tailed)	Mean Difference	Std. Error Difference	95% Confidence Interval of the Difference	
Score	Equal variances assumed	.220	.642	-2.077	37	.045	-9.044	4.355	-17.868	-.221
	Equal variances not assumed			-2.075	36.772	.045	-9.044	4.358	-17.876	-.213

Table 3. The t-test of the students pretest

The posttest was held after the treatments, to see if there any differential of the students speaking ability of both classes after the treatments.

Classification	Score	Storytelling		Role Play	
		Posttest			
		F	P(%)	F	P(%)
Excellent	86 – 100	0	0	1	5
Very Good	71 – 85	0	0	2	10
Good	56 – 70	5	26	2	10
Average	41 – 55	4	21	9	45
Poor	26 – 40	2	11	5	25
Very Poor	< 26	8	42	1	5
Total		19	100	20	100

Table 4. Frequency and Percentage of Posttest Score for both groups

The students posttest score result for E1 are categorized as Good, Average, Poor, and Very Poor.

In E1 class, the data shows that there were 5 (26%) students got *Good* categorize, 4 (21%)

students got *Average*, 2 (11%) students got *Poor*, and 8(42%) students got *Very Poor*. While in E2 class, the posttest result are categorizes as Excellent, Very Good, Good, Average, Poor, and Very Poor. There were 1 (5%) students got *Excellent* categorize, 2 (50%) students got *Very Good*, 2 (10%) students *Good*, 9 (45%) students got *Average*, 5 (25%) got *Poor*, and 1 (5%) got *Very Poor*.

Group Statistics

	Class	N	Mean	Std. Deviation	Std. Error Mean
Score	Storytelling	19	30.12	13.774	3.160
	Role Play	20	39.16	13.420	3.001

Table 5. The Mean Score and Standard Deviation of the students pretest.

The mean score showed that there was a significant difference in using Storytelling and Role Play to the speaking ability of the students. The means score of the students taught by Storytelling was 39.18 and by Role Play was 49.44. It means that the speaking ability of the students in Role Play was higher than Storytelling. In E1, the classification of the students pretest and posttest were same, even though the numbers of students increased for good and average classification and decreased in poor and very poor classification, but in positive way. In E2 class, there were significant differences from pretest and posttest result. If in pretest the students were classified in three categories, in posttest the students fulfilled all classification.

Independent Samples Test

		Levene's Test for Equality of Variances		t-test for Equality of Means						
		F	Sig.	t	df	Sig. (2-tailed)	Mean Difference	Std. Error Difference	95% Confidence Interval of the Difference	
score									Lower	Upper
score	Equal variances assumed	2.315	.137	-1.835	37	.075	-10.256	5.588	-21.579	1.067
	Equal variances not assumed			-1.829	35.828	.076	-10.256	5.607	-21.630	1.118

Table 6. The t-test of the students posttest

The result of *p value* of the posttest from the table above shows score 0.075 which is higher than 0.05 ($0.075 > 0.05$). so from this scores, the researcher conclude that the H_0 hypothesis is accepted and the H_1 hypothesis is rejected or in other words *there is no significant difference on speaking through Storytelling and Role Play of SMP students.*

Based on the data above the researcher concludes that in speaking, whether in Storytelling or in Role Play, the students have same ability. Even though there was some improvement from the scores the students got from the pretest to the posttest but the difference was no to significant in the used of both methods. This result was supported by some articles and researches that the researcher had explained in the previous chapter.

The article of Islam & Islam (2012) stated that role play technique has positive impact in improving learners' speaking skills as it gives the students a chance to explore different situations of real life and enables them to speak accurately and confidently in that situation in the target language. also Kusnierek (2015) conclude in her research revealed that implementing role-play activities develops students' speaking skills. Such a task is more appealing to the learners because they find it funny to play someone else's role.

Ozdemir (2015) found that Storytelling technique is a powerful tool in language classes. He also stated that technique, that make the students to be more active, such as story-based lessons, provide a rich exposure to comprehensible input which improves vocabulary learning of the students. Kamarauddin in Rahman (2014) mentioned that the big problem the students usually get in learning English, especially speaking skill is the lack of vocabulary. The fluency of students in speaking English usually because they have minimum vocabulary to know or memorize. Here, the teachers are expected to give some treatment or activities to increase the students' lack of vocabulary by giving them activities to enrich their vocabulary.

There are some factors that influence the result of this research. First, both methods, Storytelling and Role Play in practical were fun and motivating. Although in Storytelling the students mainly focus to their selves, the students still enjoy the activity because they act based on the roles they. In Role Play, the students have a high chance to cooperate and connected with the other students, it was interesting because the students pretend to be another person based on the role they played. Limbu (2014) also stated that Role Play can help students to understand that there are casual relationships between peoples' behavior and the outcomes of events. This understanding is enhanced because the consequences of behaviors can be immediately observed and self-image.

The second factor is both methods exercise the students' imagination Dujmovic (2016). Children can become personally involved in a story as they identify with the characters, even play the characters and try to interpret the narrative and illustrations. This imaginative experience helps develop their own creative powers. Another factor is come from Harmer in Limbu (2012) is the methods give the chance to the quieter students to express themselves in a more forthright way especially the Role Play method. Like what already explain by Lakamaruddin in Rahman (2014) that the factors influence the students in speaking English are first psychological factors that are the students are usually ashamed, awkward, and afraid in speaking English to their partner or their teachers or to the other people. The second is cognitive factor that is the students' lack of the mastering of English grammar and vocabulary. The third factor is the words are also different to pronounce and to express their ideas in English. The last factor is the students are difficult to find out the situation in which they can practice their English more frequently. Both methods, Storytelling and Role Play, had proved that those factors above didn't influence the students much because those methods make them enjoyable and relax at the same time.

Students Interest

No	Interval	Categories	Frequency	Percentage (%)
1	85-100	Very High	3	15.8
2	69-84	High	10	52.6
3	52-68	Moderate	6	31.6
4	36-51	Low	0	0.0
5	20-35	Very Low	0	0.0
Total			19	100.0

Table 7. students interest in Storytelling

The result indicate that 3 (15.8%) students were “very high” interest, 10 (52.6%) students were “high: interest, 6 (31.6%) students were “moderate” and none of the students were “low” and

“very low” interest. It means that all of the students were interested in learning English, specially speaking by using Storytelling method.

No	Interval	Categories	Frequency	Percentage (%)
1	85-100	Very High	3	15.0
2	69-84	High	12	60.0
3	52-68	Moderate	5	25.0
4	36-51	Low	0	0.0
5	20-35	Very Low	0	0.0
Total			20	100.0

Table 8. students interest in Role Play

The result indicate that 3 (15%) students were “very high” interest, 12 (60%) students were “high” interest, 5 (25%) students were “moderate” and none of the students were “low” and “very low” interest. It means that all of the students were interested in learning English, specially speaking by using Role Play method.

Related with the students interest, and based on the table 7 and table 8, both methods were in the same categorize of interest, but the result of the questionnaires showed that the students had a higher interest in Role Play than in Storytelling. (Zatriany, 2016) in her research concludes that the use of role play can influence the students learning interest, where before the treatment, the students interest in learning is categorized as low.

Storytelling, in contrary, also can improve the students speaking ability, related with this research, to compare these two methods; Role Play had higher score than in Storytelling, but the last conclusion state that even though there was a different in score, there was no significant difference in the speaking ability of the students through Storytelling and Role Play, where the

students were more prominent In speaking through Role Play, and students had a very high interest in Role Play than in Storytelling.

CONCLUSION

Based on the discussion on findings above, the researcher conclude that :

1. There was no significant difference of the students speaking ability through Storytelling and Role Play. Although the scores of the research showed there were some improvements from the pretest and posttest, the change was not too significant. It proved by the finding of the *p value* (0.075) which is higher than 0.05. So, the researcher concludes that there was no significant difference of the students speaking ability through Storytelling and Role Play. Related with the problem statement, the researcher made a conclusion that the students had a same speaking skill level by using both methods, Storytelling and Role Play.
2. Related with the students' interest in the using of Storytelling and Role Play methods in speaking, the result of the questionnaires' score showed that the students classify that they had very high interest on both methods, but based on the scores, the students were more interest in Role Play than in Storytelling. It was proved by the mean score of Role Play (99.45) was higher than Storytelling (93.79). So, it can be conclude that the students had more interest in Role Play than in Storytelling.